

REAL ESTATE APPRAISER ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Professional and Vocational Licensing Division
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs
State of Hawaii

MINUTES OF MEETING

Date: Wednesday, December 6, 2023

Time: 10:00 a.m.

In-Person Meeting Location: King Kalakaua Conference Room
HRH King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, First Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Virtual: Virtual Videoconference Meeting – Zoom Webinar (use link below)
<https://dcca-hawaii-gov.zoom.us/j/86935452702>
Meeting ID: 869 3545 2702

Zoom Recording Link: https://youtu.be/0qVK_FP0U_I

Agenda: The agenda was posted on the State electronic calendar as required by HRS section 92-7(b).

Members Present: Fernando Benavente, Industry Member, Chairperson
Aimee Yamamoto, Industry Member, Vice-Chairperson
Brian Brennan, Financial Institution Member
Mark Komatsu, Industry Member
Ron Rehkemper, Industry Member

Members Excused: None.

Staff Present: Hector West, Executive Officer (“EO West”)
Shelley Choy, Program Specialist
James Paige, Deputy Attorney General (“DAG”)
Kai Cockett, Secretary
Mia Hoang, Technical Support
Johnny Li, Technical Support

Zoom Webinar Guest(s): None

Virtual Meeting Instructions: The Chair provided information on internet and phone access for today’s virtual meeting and announced that today’s meeting was being recorded and that the recording will be posted on the Board’s web page.

Call to Order: The Chair took roll call of the Board members.

In accordance with Act 220, SLH 2021, all Board members attending virtually confirmed that they were alone in their nonpublic location.

After taking roll, quorum was established, and the meeting was called to order at 10:16 a.m.

Chairperson's Report: The Chair stated that he has nothing to report.

Executive Officer's Report: EO West stated that he would like to remind everyone that the renewal will end December 31, 2023. He would like to remind those who receive their license from January through June of 2023 must provide proof of 14 hours of CE. Those receiving their license after June 30, 2023 are not required to submit any proof of CE hours. Those who will be issued a license before January 1, 2024 they will need to submit proof of 28 CE credits.

Ratification of the November 1, 2023 Meeting: EO West stated the next agenda item is the ratification of the last meeting that was on November 1, 2023, the reason being is because of someone was unbeing able to access the meeting via zoom. This will be giving them the chance if they are here, and they will be able to raise questions. The Board will not be revoting, they are ratifying on what they did at the November 1, 2023 meeting.

Approval of minutes for August 2, 2023 meeting

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

After discussion, it was moved by the Chair, seconded by Mr. Rehkemper, and unanimously carried to approve the August 2, 2023, meeting minutes as circulated.

Applications from the November 1, 2023 meeting ratification

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

A. Review of Application:

- 1) Miki Amy Nishihara
(Certified Residential Appraiser)
- 2) Lauren Smithers
(Certified Residential Appraiser)

It was moved by the Chair, seconded by Mr. Komatsu, and unanimously carried to ratify the applications for Miki Amy Nishihara and Lauren Smithers for Certified Residential Appraisers from the November 1, 2023 meeting.

- 3) Jared Miyashiro
(Certified General Appraiser)
- 4) Kanae Bamba
(Certified General Appraiser)

It was moved by the Vice-Chair, seconded by Mr. Rehkemper, and unanimously carried to ratify the applications for Jared Miyashiro and Kanae Bamba for Certified General Appraisers from the November 1, 2023 meeting.

B. Review of Out-of-State Endorsement Applications

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

- 1) Richard F Duncan
(Certified General Appraiser)

It was moved by the Chair, seconded by Mr. Komatsu, and unanimously carried to ratify the application of Richard F. Duncan for Certified General Appraiser license from the November 1, 2023 meeting.

C. **Review of Courses**

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

It was moved by the Chair, seconded by Ron Rehkemper, and unanimously carried to ratify the following non-CAP and CAP approved courses from the November 1, 2023 meeting.

Course Provider: Hawaii Chapter of the Appraisal Institute

Index #: Course Title & Approval Hours

23-309 Breaking the Barriers, A Candid Case Study Collaboration
3 CE w/o exam

23-310 Becoming Proficient in Fractional Interest Valuation
7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning, LLC

23-312 The Life of an Appraisal - What Happens Next?
4 CE w/o exam

23-318 Measuring Square Footage with ANSI Z765-2021 (Online)
4 CE w/o exam

23-433 Appraiser Liability 101: Essential Concepts
4 CE w/o exam

23-434 Learning Home Measurement
5 CE w/o exam

23-435 Desktop 101: Navigating GSE Appraisal Modernization (Online)
4 CE w/o exam

23-436 ANSI, Home Measurement & the Power of Price-Per-Square-Foot
7 CE w/o exam

23-437 Public Records, Square Footage & the Real Estate Information Crisis
7 CE w/o exam

23-438 Appraiser's Guide to Covering Your Appraisals
4 CE w/o exam

23-439 Commercial Property Valuation
7 CE w/o exam

23-440 Sales Comparison Approach & A Course on Analysis & Reporting
7 CE w/o exam

- 23-441 Appraising 2-4 Unit MF Properties
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-442 Depreciated Replacement Cost
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-443 Appraising Complex Properties with Unique Characteristics
3.5 CE w/ exam
- 23-444 Appraiser's Guide to Appraisal Inspections (Online)
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-445 Appraiser's Guide to Appraisal Inspections (Classroom)
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-477 Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar (Livestream)
15 CE w/ exam
14 CE w/o exam
- 23-480 Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar (Classroom)
15 CE w/ exam
14 CE w/o exam
- 23-484 Practical Applications in Appraising Green Commercial Properties
(Classroom)
15 CE w/ exam
14 CE w/o exam
- 23-485 Practical Applications in Appraising Green Commercial Properties
(Livestream)
15 CE w/ exam
14 CE w/o exam
- 23-487 Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts (Livestream)
8 CE w/ exam
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-488 Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles & Concepts (Classroom)
8 CE w/ exam
7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

- 23-510 Fundamentals of Appraising Affordable Housing (Synchronous)
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-511 Fundamentals of Appraising Affordable Housing (Online)
7 CE w/o exam
- 23-512 Fundamentals of Separating Real Property Personal Property and
Intangible Business Assets (Classroom)
15 CE w/ exam
14 CE w/o exam

23-517 2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course (Livestream)
7 CE w/o exam

23-518 2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course (Classroom)
7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Calypso Continuing Education

23-418 Appraising Energy Efficient Residential Properties
8 CE w/ exam

23-419 Mold, A Growing Concern
3.5 CE w/ exam

23-420 Victorian Era Architecture for Real Estate Professionals
3.5 CE w/ exam

23-421 FHA Site Inspection for Appraisers
7 CE w/ exam

23-422 Construction Details, Concept to Completion
7 CE w/ exam

23-423 Appraising Manufactured Homes in America
7 CE w/ exam

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning

23-320 Selecting and Supporting Market Adjustments
3 CE w/o exam

23-342 Creating Formulas that Work
7 CE w/o exam

23-446 Appraiser's Guide to the Income Approach
7 CE w/o exam

23-447 Diversifying Your Practice Inside and Out
7 CE w/o exam

23-448 Appraising Limited Market Properties
4 CE w/o exam

23-449 FHA Roadmap
7 CE w/o exam

23-450 The Other Appraisal Reports: Exploring Restricted & Oral Appraisal
Reports
7 CE w/o exam

23-451 Critique - Anatomy of a Review
7 CE w/o exam

23-452 How to Appraise Solar Panels

	7 CE w/o exam
23-453	Desktop 101: Navigating GSE Appraisal Modernization 4 CE w/o exam
23-454	Advanced Appraisal Review 7 CE w/o exam
23-455	Non-Lending Appraisals: Expanding Your Appraisal Practice 7 CE w/o exam
23-456	Ultimate Work file: What, When, Why 4 CE w/o exam
23-457	Top 15 Takeaways from Your Colleagues' Legal Misfortunes 3 CE w/o exam
23-458	Elimination of Bias and Cultural Competency for Appraisers - with Real World Relevance 3 CE w/o exam
Course Provider: Appraisal Institute	
23-465	Advanced Spreadsheet Modeling for Valuation Applications 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-466	Application & Interpretation of Simple Linear Regression 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-468	Online Appraiser's Guide to Expert Witnessing 7 CE w/o exam
23-472	Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings (Livestream) 8 CE w/ exam 7 CE w/o exam
23-475	Condemnation Appraising Principles and Applications (Classroom) 22 CE w/ exam 21 CE w/o exam
23-496	Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions: Practical Applications (Classroom) 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-497	The Appraiser as an Expert Witness: Preparation and Testimony (Classroom) 16 CE w/ exam 15 CE w/o exam

23-509 Fundamentals of Appraising Affordable Housing (Classroom)
 7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Calypso Continuing Education

23-424 Environmental Hazards Impact on Value
 7 CE w/ exam

23-425 A Brief Historic Stroll Through America's
 Architectural Styles
 7 CE w/ exam

23-426 Acquainting Ourselves with the ANSI Standard: Measuring Residential
 Properties
 7 CE w/ exam

23-427 Cost Approach and Land Valuation
 7 CE w/ exam

23-428 Cultural Competency and Elimination of Bias in Appraisals
 3 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index No.	Title	Hours
23-311	Community Land Trust (CLT) Appraisal Training (Classroom)	4 CE w/o exam
23-313	Review Case Studies - General (Classroom)	32 QE 32 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-314	Review Case Studies - Residential (Classroom)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-317	Inconsistency It's Hiding in Plain Sight in Your Residential Appraisal	7 CE w/o exam
23-321	Artificial Intelligence, Blockchain, and the Metaverse Implications for Valuation	7 CE w/o exam
23-327	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-328	Desktop Appraisals (Bifurcated, Hybrid) and Evaluations	7 CE w/o exam
23-329	Online Subdivision Valuation	7 CE w/o exam
23-330	Online Rates and Ratios: Making Sense of GIMs, OARs, and DCF	7 CE w/o exam
23-331	Online Residential & Commercial Valuation of Solar	15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-332	Advanced Income Capitalization	33 QE 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-333	Online Supervisory Appraiser/Trainee Appraiser Course	4 CE w/o exam
23-334	Advanced Concepts & Case Studies	38 QE 28 CE w/ exam 35 CE w/o exam
23-335	Online Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam

23-336	Online Appraising Condos, Co-ops, and PUDs	7 CE w/o exam
23-337	Online Comparative Analysis	7 CE w/o exam
23-338	Supervisory Appraiser/Trainee Appraiser Course	5 CE w/ exam 4 CE w/o exam
23-339	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, Part 1 (Classroom, Synchronous)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-340	General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 1	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-341	General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 2	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-343	Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part 2	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-344	Basic Appraisal Procedures (Classroom)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-345	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach - Update	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-346	Historic Preservation (Façade) Easements: Appraisal Techniques & Valuation Issues (Classroom)	7 CE w/o exam
23-347	Online Analyzing Operating Expenses	7 CE w/o exam
23-348	Inconsistency It's Hiding in Plain Sight in your Appraisal	7 CE w/o exam
23-349	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-350	Online Appraising Convenience Stores	7 CE w/o exam
23-351	Online Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings	8 CE w/ exam 7 CE w/o exam
23-352	Online Data Verification Methods	5 CE w/o exam
23-353	Online The Discounted Cash Flow Model - Concepts, Issues, & Applications	5 CE w/o exam
23-354	Online Introduction to Green Buildings - Principles and Concepts	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
23-355	Online Eminent Domain & Condemnation	7 CE w/o exam
23-356	Measure it Right - Using the ANSI-Z7965-2021 Standard for Residential Properties	4 CE w/o exam
23-357	Online Rapid Response: Market Analysis in Volatile Markets	7 CE w/o exam
23-358	Online - Expand Your Practice Arbitration Do's and Don'ts	7 CE w/o exam
23-359	Online Cool Tools: New Technology for Real Estate Appraisers	7 CE w/o exam
23-360	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies (Classroom)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-361	Online General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 1	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-362	Online Thinking Outside the Form	4 CE w/o exam
23-363	Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-364	Practical Application of Fundamental Analysis	7 CE w/o exam

23-365	Review Case Studies - General	32 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-367	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-368	Online The Discounted Cash Flow Model - Concepts, Issues, & Applications	5 CE w/o exam
23-369	Online Valuation Resources for Photovoltaic Systems	3 CE w/o exam
23-370	Review Case Studies - Residential	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-371	Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course	5 CE w/ exam 4 CE w/o exam
23-372	Review Theory - General	33 QE w/ exam 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-373	Valuation Overview of Accessory Dwelling Units	7 CE w/o exam
23-374	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-375	Appraisal of Manufactured Homes	7.5 CE w/o
23-376	Online Business Practice and Ethics	6 CE w/o exam
23-377	Online Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-378	Online Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-379	General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies (Classroom)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-380	Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics and Applications	22.50 QE 22.50 CE w/ exam 21.50 CE
23-381	Online Fundamentals of Apartment Appraising	7 CE w/o exam
23-382	Online Practical Application of the Residential Sales Comparison Approach	4 CE w/o exam
23-383	Online General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-384	Online FHA Appraising - Principles and Procedures	7 CE w/o exam
23-385	Fundamentals of the Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land	4 CE w/o exam
23-386	Online Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-387	Online Review Residential Appraisals and Using Fannie Mae Form 2000	7 CE w/o exam
23-388	Online Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuations Modeling	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-389	Online Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-390	Online Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approach	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam

23-391	Quantitative Analysis	33 QE 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-392	Online Understanding and Appraising Residential REOs	4 CE w/o exam
23-393	Online Small Hotel/Motel Valuation	7 CE w/o exam
23-394	Online Using your HP12C Financial Calculator	7 CE w/o exam
23-395	Rural Area Applications & Freddie Mae Guidelines and Reporting Eligibility Requirements	7 CE w/o exam
23-396	The Cost Approach: Unnecessary or Vital to a Healthy Practice?	7 CE w/o exam
23-397	2020-2021 15-Hour Equivalent USPAP Course	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-398	Community Land Trust (CLT) Appraisal Training	4 CE w/o exam
23-399	General Appraisal Report Writing and Case Studies	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-400	Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	33 QE 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-401	Online General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-402	Valuating of Conservation Easements (Classroom)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-403	Online General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-404	Online Forecasting Revenue	7 CE w/o exam
23-405	Online Case Studies in Appraising Green Commercial Buildings	15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-406	Online Appraising Automobile Dealership	7 CE w/o exam
23-407	Getting it Right from the Start - A Workout Plan for your Scope of Work	7 CE w/o exam
23-408	Online Appraisal of Manufactured Homes and Next- Generation	8.5 CE w/ exam 7.5 CE w/o
23-409	Online Appraisal of Medical Office Buildings	7 CE w/o exam
23-410	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-411	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-412	Business Practices and Ethics	6 CE w/o exam
23-413	Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-414	Review Theory - Residential	17 CE w/ exam 15 CE w/o exam
23-416	Online Excel Applications for Valuation	8 CE w/o exam
23-430	Fundamentals of Appraising Affordable Housing	7 CE w/o exam
23-431	Fundamental of Appraising Affordable Housing Synchronous	7 CE w/o exam

23-460	Advanced Concepts & Case Studies Synchronous	38 QE 38 CE w/ exam 35 CE w/o exam
23-461	Advanced Income Capitalization Synchronous	33 QE 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-462	Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use Synchronous	33 QE 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-463	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, Part 1 Synchronous	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-464	Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part 2 Synchronous	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-467	Online Appraising Condos, Co-ops, and PUDs	7 CE w/o exam
23-469	Business Practices and Ethics (Classroom)	6 CE w/o exam
23-470	Business Practices and Ethics (Online)	6 CE w/o exam
23-471	Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings (Classroom)	8 CE w/ exam 7 CE w/o exam
23-473	Community Land Trust (CLT) Appraisal Training (Classroom)	4 CE w/o exam
23-474	Community Land Trust (CLT) Appraisal Training (Livestream)	4 CE w/o exam
23-476	Quantitative Analysis (Synchronous)	33 QE 33 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-478	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies (Livestream)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-479	Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling (Synchronous)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-481	Review Case Studies - General (Synchronous)	32 QE 32 CE w/ exam 30 CE w/o exam
23-482	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches (Livestream)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-483	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach (Synchronous)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-486	Practical Applications of Fundamental Analysis (Classroom)	7 CE w/o exam
23-489	Inconsistency: It's Hiding in Plain Sight in Your Residential Appraisal (Classroom)	7 CE w/o exam
23-490	Inconsistency: It's Hiding in Plain Sight in Your Residential Appraisal (Livestream)	7 CE w/o exam
23-491	Getting it Right from the Start: A Workout Plan for your Scope of Work (Livestream)	7 CE w/o exam
23-492	Historic Preservation (Façade) Easements: Appraisal Techniques & Valuation Issues (Livestream)	7 CE w/o exam
23-493	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach (Livestream)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-494	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach (Livestream)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam

23-495	Online General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-498	Review Theory - General (Synchronous)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-499	Review Case Studies - Residential (Synchronous)	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam
23-500	General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 2 (Livestream)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-501	General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 2 (Online)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-502	General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use (Classroom)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-503	General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use (Livestream)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-504	Basic Appraisal Principles (Synchronous)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-505	Artificial Intelligence, Blockchain, and the Metaverse Implications for Valuation (Livestream)	7 CE w/o exam
23-506	Artificial Intelligence, Blockchain, and the Metaverse Implications for Valuation (Classroom)	7 CE w/o exam
23-507	Desktop Appraisals (Bifurcated, Hybrid) and Evaluations (Classroom)	7 CE w/o exam
23-508	Excel Applications for Valuation (Online)	8 CE w/o exam
23-513	General Appraiser Income Approach/Part 1 (Classroom)	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-516	2024-2025 7-Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course	7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Dynasty School

Index No.	Title	Hours
23-415	Advanced Residential Application & Case Studies	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: McKissock, LLC

Index No.	Title	Hours
23-323	Appraisal of Fast-Food Facilities	7 CE w/o exam
23-324	Land and Site Valuation	7 CE w/o exam
23-325	Complex Properties: The Odd Side of Appraisal	7 CE w/o exam
23-326	That's a Violation	4 CE w/o exam
23-417	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam

23-432	2024-2025 7-hour National USPAP Update Course	7 CE w/o exam
23-459	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: The CE Shop, LLC

Index No.	Title	Hours
23-315	Characteristics Influencing Appraisals	6 CE w/o exam
23-316	Appraisal Ethics and Valuation Bias	3 CE w/o exam
23-319	Reviewing Property Ownership and Real Estate Markets	7 CE w/o exam
23-322	Reviewing Appraisal Valuation Procedures	4 CE w/o exam
23-429	Reviewing Real Estate Title, Transfers, and Contracts	5 CE w/o exam
23-514	Appraisal Economics and Value	7 CE w/o exam
23-515	Supervisory Appraiser/Trainee Appraiser Course	4 CE w/o exam

D. Regulated Industries Complaints Office

It was moved by the Vice-Chair, seconded by Mr. Rehkemper, and unanimously carried to ratify the names on the RICO Advisory Committee List and any additional interim appointees that RICO deems necessary to aid its investigations from the November 1, 2023 meeting.

New Business:

A. Approval of the minutes of the November 1, 2023 meeting:

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

It was moved by the Chair, seconded by Mr. Rehkemper, and unanimously carried to approve the November 1, 2023 meeting minutes as circulated.

B. Review of Courses:

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

The Chair advised the Committee members that he reviewed the following NON-CAP courses index 24-099; 24-096; and 24-114 and the Vice-Chair reviewed index 24-100 and 24-107, all the other courses listed are CAP approved by the AQB course approval program.

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning

Index No.	Title	Hours
24-096	2024-2025 7 Hour National USPAP Update Course	7 CE w/o exam
24-114	Believe It or Not: Creating Credible and Supported Adjustments	4 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index No.	Title	Hours
24-098	2024-2025 7-Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course	7 CE w/o exam
24-099	2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course (Livestream)	7 CE w/o exam
24-100	2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course (Classroom)	7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: The CE Shop, LLC

Index No.	Title	Hours
24-109	Appraisal Ethics and Valuation Bias	3 CE w/o exam
24-110	Characteristics Influencing Appraisals	6 CE w/o exam
24-111	Reviewing Appraisal Valuation Procedures	4 CE w/o exam
24-112	Reviewing Property Ownership and Real Estate Markets	7 CE w/o exam
24-113	Reviewing Real Estate, Title, Transfers, and Contracts	5 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: McKissock

Index No.	Title	Hours
24-001	Appraising Small Apartment Properties	4 CE w/o exam
24-002	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
24-003	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
24-004	Bifurcated and Hybrid Appraisal: A Practical Approach	4 CE w/o exam
24-005	Diversify Your Appraisal with Assessment Appeals	4 CE
24-006	Fundamentals of Expert Witness Testimony	4 CE
24-007	Learning From the Mistakes of Others Appraisal Disciplinary Case Studies	3 CE
24-008	Market Disturbances - Appraisals in Atypical Markets and Cycles	4 CE
24-009	New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes	3 CE
24-010	Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-011	Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-012	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-013	Supporting Adjustments: The Journey from Analysis to Adjusting	4 CE
24-014	Using Appraisal Report Templates Responsibly	3 CE
24-015	Valuation of Residential Solar	3 CE
24-016	Live Webinar: Appraising Complex and Stigmatized Residential Properties	7 CE
24-017	Live Webinar: Appraising Condominium Units	3 CE
24-018	Live Webinar: Appraising Small Apartment Properties	4 CE
24-019	Live Webinar: Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam

24-020	Live Webinar: Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
24-021	Responding to a Reconsideration of Value (ROV)	3 CE
24-022	Live Webinar: Bifurcated and Hybrid Appraisals: A Practical Approach	4 CE
24-023	Live Webinar: Diversify Your Appraisal Practice with Estate Appraisals	3 CE
24-024	Live Webinar: Diversify Your Practice with Assessment Appeals	4 CE
24-025	Live Webinar: Measuring 1-4 Unit Residential Properties - With ANSI Z765 Standard	4 CE
24-026	Live Webinar: New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes	3 CE
24-027	Live Webinar: REO Appraisal: Guidelines and Best Practices	4 CE
24-028	Live Webinar: Residential Property Inspections: An Appraiser's Perspective	7 CE
24-029	Live Webinar: Responding to a Reconsideration of Value (ROV)	3 CE
24-030	Live Webinar: Supporting Adjustments: The Journey from Analysis to Adjusting	4 CE
24-031	Live Webinar: The Appraiser's Guide to HUD Handbook 4000.1	7 CE
24-032	Live Webinar: The Fundamentals of Appraising Luxury Homes	4 CE
24-033	Live Webinar: Using Appraisal Report Templates Responsibly	3 CE
24-034	Live Webinar: Valuation of Residential Solar	3 CE
24-035	Live Webinar: Mortgage Lending Appraisal Requirements: Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac	7 CE
24-036	Live Webinar: Focus on FHA Minimum Property Requirements	4 CE
24-037	Live Webinar: Fundamentals of Expert Witness Testimony	4 CE
24-038	Live Webinar: Land and Site Valuation	5 CE
24-039	Live Webinar: Learning from the Mistakes of Others: Appraisal Disciplinary Case Studies	3 CE
24-040	Live Webinar: Market Disturbances - Market Analysis in Atypical Markets and Cycles	4 CE
24-041	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies	15 QE 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-042	Appraisal of Fast-Food Facilities	7 CE w/o exam
24-043	Appraisal of Industrial and Flex Buildings	7 CE
24-044	Appraisal of REO and Foreclosure Properties	7 CE
24-045	Appraisal of Self-Storage Facilities	7 CE
24-046	Appraisal Subject Matter Electives	20 QE w/exam 20 CE w/exam 18 CE w/o exam
24-047	Appraising Today's Manufactured Homes	7 CE
24-048	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-049	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-050	Best Practices for Completing Bifurcated and Hybrid Appraisals	3 CE
24-051	Commercial Appraisal Review - Subject Matter Elective	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 13.5 CE w/o exam
24-052	Commercial Land Valuation	4 CE
24-053	Complex Properties: The Odd Side of Appraisal	7 CE
24-054	The Cost Approach	7 CE

24-055	Divorce and Estate Appraisals: Elements of Non-Lender Work	4 CE
24-056	Evaluating Today's Residential Appraisal: Reliable Review	7 CE
24-057	Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers - Subject Matter Electives	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 13.5 CE w/o exam
24-058	Fair Housing, Bias, and Discrimination	4 CE
24-059	General Appraiser Income Approach	60 QE w/exam 60 CE w/exam 55 CE w/o exam
24-060	General Appraiser Market Analysis Highest & Best Use	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-061	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-062	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-063	General Report Writing & Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-064	Green Building Concepts for Appraiser	7 CE
24-065	GSE Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines	7 CE
24-066	Income Approach Case Studies for Commercial Appraisal	4 CE
24-067	Intermediate Income Approach Case Studies for Commercial Appraisers	4 CE
24-068	Introduction to Commercial Appraisal Review	7 CE
24-069	Introduction to Expert Witness Testimony for Appraisers - To Do or Not to Do	4 CE
24-070	Land and Site Valuation	7 CE
24-071	Market Disturbances - Appraisals in Atypical Markets and Cycles	3 CE
24-072	New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes	3 CE
24-073	Relocation Appraisal and the New ERC Form	6 CE
24-074	Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-075	Residential Construction and the Appraiser	7 CE
24-076	Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-077	Residential Property Inspection for Appraisers	7 CE
24-078	Residential Property Measurement and ANSI Z765	4 CE
24-079	Residential Report Writing: More Than Forms	7 CE
24-080	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-081	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
24-082	Statistics, Modeling and Finance	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
24-083	Supervisor - Trainee Course for Hawaii	4 CE
24-084	Supporting Your Adjustments - Methods for Residential Appraisers	3 CE

24-085	That's a Violation	4 CE
24-086	The Basics of Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers	7 CE
24-087	The FHA Handbook 4000.1	7 CE
24-088	The Fundamentals of Appraising Luxury Homes	4 CE
24-089	The Income Approach: An Overview	7 CE
24-090	The Sales Comparison Approach	7 CE
24-091	Understanding Luxury Home Features	7 CE
24-092	Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions (Yellow Book) Course	14 CE
24-093	VA Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines	7 CE
24-094	Valuation of Residential Green Buildings	4 CE
24-095	Valuation of Residential Solar	3 CE
24-097	Live Webinar: 2024-2025 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course	7 CE w/o exam
24-108	2024 15-Hour National USPAP Course	15 CE 15 CE w/ exam 14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: OREP Education Network

Index No.	Title	Hours
24-101	How to Raise Appraisal Quality and Minimize Risk	7 CE w/o exam
24-102	FHA Appraisal Standards	7 CE w/o exam
24-103	Identifying and Correcting Appraisal Failures	7 CE w/o exam
24-104	Non-Lending Appraisal Assignments Expanding Your Appraisal Practice	7 CE w/o exam
24-105	Appraisal Adjustments II: Solving Complex Problems	7 CE w/o exam
24-106	How to Support and Prove your Adjustments	7 CE w/o exam
24-107	Appraiser Liability and Risk Management	4 CE w/o exam

C. Delegation of Authority:

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

- i. Delegation of Approval of Courses to Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee Industry Members

It was moved by the Chair, seconded by Ron Rehkemper, and unanimously carried to approve the delegation of approval of non-CAP courses to the Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee Industry Members.

The Chair asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

- ii. Delegation of Approval of AQB Approved Courses to its Program Executive Officer

It was moved by the Chair, seconded by Mark Komatsu, and unanimously carried to approve the delegation of approval of AQB approved courses to its Program Executive Officer.

Next Meeting:

Date: Wednesday, February 14, 2024
 Time: 10:00 a.m.

In-Person: Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
HRH King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, First Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813
Virtual: Zoom Webinar

Adjournment: With no further business to discuss, the Chair adjourned the meeting at 10:31 a.m.

Reviewed and approved by:

Taken and recorded by:

/s/ Hector West

/s/ Kai Cockett

Hector West
Executive Officer

Kai Cockett
Secretary

HW: kc

03/20/2024

[] Minutes approved as is.

[] Minutes approved with changes. See Minutes of _____.

DRAFT