

REAL ESTATE APPRAISER ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Professional and Vocational Licensing Division
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs
State of Hawaii

MINUTES OF MEETING

Date: June 7, 2023

Time: 1:30 p.m.

In-Person Meeting Location: Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
HRH King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, First Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Virtual Participation: Virtual Videoconference Meeting – Zoom Webinar
(use link below)
<https://dcca-hawaii-gov.zoom.us/j/97575801516>

Present: Shelly H. Tanaka, Industry Member, Chairperson
Fernando Benavente, Industry Member, Vice Chairperson
Aimee Yamamoto, Industry Member
Lars B. Larson, Public Member
Brian Brennan, Financial Institution Member
James Paige, Deputy Attorney General
Hector West, Executive Officer
Shelley Choy, Program Specialist
Leanne Abe, Secretary
Mia Hoang, Technical Support

Excused: None.

Zoom Webinar Guest(s): Sean K. Tiwanak

Agenda: The agenda for this meeting was posted to the State electronic calendar as required by Hawaii Revised Statutes (“HRS”) section 92-7(b).

A brief video was played to explain procedures for this virtual meeting and how members of the public can participate and interact with the Committee during the meeting.

Call to Order: There being a quorum present, the meeting was called to order at 1:35 p.m. by Chairperson Tanaka.

Chairperson Tanaka proceeded with roll call of members. All Committee members were present and alone in their off-site locations.

Approval of the April 5, 2023, Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the June 7, 2023 Meeting
Page 2

Meeting Minutes:

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Vice Chairperson Benavente, and unanimously carried to approve the April 5, 2023, meeting minutes as circulated.

New Business:

Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

A. Review of Applications:

- 1). Kathren J. Rosales
(Certified Residential Appraiser - ratification)

Chairperson Tanaka advised the Committee members that Ms. Yamamoto reviewed the application of Ms. Rosales. Three (3) random sample reports were provided with the application, and Ms. Rosales appears to meet the qualifications for licensure.

It was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to ratify the license of Ms. Rosales for Certified Residential Appraiser.

- 2). Sean K. Tiwanak
(Certified Residential Appraiser)

Chairperson Tanaka advised the Committee members that she reviewed the application of Mr. Tiwanak. Three (3) random sample reports were provided with the application, and Mr. Tiwanak appears to meet the qualifications for licensure.

It was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to approve the application of Mr. Tiwanak for Certified Residential Appraiser license.

- 3). David T.Y. Andrew
(Certified General Appraiser)

Chairperson Tanaka advised the Committee members that Vice Chairperson Benavente reviewed the application of Mr. Andrew. Three (3) random sample reports were provided with the application, and Mr. Andrew appears to meet the qualifications for licensure.

It was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to approve the

application of Mr. Andrew for Certified General Appraiser license.

B. Review of Courses

Chairperson Tanaka advised the Committee members that index #23-298 by course provider, The CE Shop, LLC titled "A Review of Appraisal Economics and Value" is a CAP approved course.

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Vice Chairperson Benavente, and unanimously carried to ratify the approval of the following renewed and/or CAP approved course:

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

<u>Index #:</u>	<u>Course Title & Approved Hours</u>
23-292	Online General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach 30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-293	Online General Appraiser Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use 30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
23-294	Online General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 1 30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
23-295	Online General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 2 30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: McKissock, LP

<u>Index #:</u>	<u>Course Title & Approved Hours</u>
23-296	Live Webinar: Responding to a Reconsideration of Value (ROV) 3 CE

23-297 GSE Appraisal Requirements and Guidelines
 (Asynchronous)
 7 CE

Course Provider: The CE Shop, LLC

Index #: Course Title & Approved Hours

23-298 A Review of Appraisal Economics and Value
 7 CE

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Vice Chairperson Benavente, and unanimously carried to approve the following courses, based on the initial review and recommendation by Chairperson Tanaka:

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning LLC

Index #: Course Title & Approved Hours

23-299 2023 UAD Redesign Vegas
 7 CE

23-300 2023 Market Conditions
 7 CE

**Permitted
Interaction
Group:**

Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

Chairperson Tanaka stated that the Permitted Interaction Group ("PIG")) met and discussed incorporating the Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal ("PAREA") into the Real Estate Appraiser Program and amendments to Hawaii Revised Statutes ("HRS") Chapter 466K and Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") Chapter 16-114.

The PIG presented its recommendations to the Committee at the February 1, 2023, meeting. Pursuant to HRS section 92-2.5(b)(1)(c), the Committee decided at the April 5, 2023, meeting that they would act on this item at a subsequent meeting to allot the public and the industry time to review and provide testimony.

It was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to adopt recommendations presented by the PIG of incorporating the Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal ("PAREA") into the Real Estate Appraiser Program and amendments to Hawaii Revised Statutes ("HRS") Chapter 466K and Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") Chapter 16-114.

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the June 7, 2023 Meeting
Page 5

Next Meeting: Wednesday, August 2, 2023
10:00 a.m.

In-Person: Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
HRH King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, First Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

and

Virtual Participation: Virtual Videoconference Meeting
Zoom Webinar

Adjournment: Chairperson Tanaka stated that it is Mr. Larson and her last meeting serving as Committee members and expressed her gratitude to the members and DCCA staff. Executive Officer West thanked Chairperson Tanaka and Mr. Larson for their invaluable service throughout these past years as a member of the Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee.

There being no further business to discuss at this time, the meeting adjourned at 1:41 p.m.

Taken and recorded by:

/s/ Leanne Abe

Leanne Abe
Secretary

Reviewed and Approved by:

/s/ Hector West

Hector West
Executive Officer

HW:la

6/15/23

[X] Minutes approved as is.

[] Minutes approved with changes. See Minutes of _____.