

REAL ESTATE APPRAISER ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Professional and Vocational Licensing Division
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs
State of Hawaii

MINUTES OF MEETING

Date: April 6, 2022

Time: 10:00 a.m.

In-Person Meeting Location: Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
HRH King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, First Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Virtual Participation: Virtual Videoconference Meeting – Zoom Webinar
(use link below)
<https://dcca-hawaii-gov.zoom.us/j/96933848661>

Present: Shelly H. Tanaka, Industry Member, Chairperson
Fernando Benavente, Industry Member, Vice-Chairperson
Aimee Yamamoto, Industry Member
Lars B. Larson, Public Member
Brian Brennan Financial Institution Member
James Paige, Deputy Attorney General (“DAG”)
Candace Ito, Acting Supervising Executive Officer, PVL, DCCA
Sherman Takao, Executive Officer
Leanne Abe, Secretary

Excused: None.

Guests: Amanda Gill
Scott DiBiasio

Agenda: The agenda for this meeting was filed with the Office of the Lieutenant Governor, as required by Hawaii Revised Statutes (“HRS”) section 92-7(b).

A brief video was played to explain procedures for this virtual meeting and how members of the public can participate and interact with the Committee during the meeting.

Call to Order: There being a quorum present, the meeting was called to order at 10:10 a.m. by Chairperson Tanaka.

Chairperson Tanaka proceeded with roll call. All Committee members were present.

Approval of the
February 2, 2022
Meeting Minutes:

Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Vice-Chairperson Benavente, and unanimously carried to approve the February 2, 2022 meeting minutes as circulated.

New Business:

Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item.

Chairperson Tanaka recognized Ms. Amanda Gill, and advised her that she may provide public testimony on this agenda item.

Ms. Gill introduced herself and inquired if her application for real estate appraiser trainee would be reviewed by the Committee at this meeting.

Executive Officer Takao responded that her application will not be reviewed by the Committee at this time. Executive Officer Takao stated that he will follow up with the applications clerk in the Licensing Branch regarding status of her application and will email her once her application has been approved. Executive Officer Takao thanked Ms. Gill for her testimony.

A. Review of Applications

- 1) Sydney Kimura
(Certified Residential Appraiser)

Chairperson Tanaka stated that Ms. Yamamoto reviewed the Certified Residential Appraiser (“CRA”) application of Sydney Kimura and concluded that she met the all the requirements for CRA licensure, and recommends approval. After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to approve the CRA application for license of Sydney Kimura.

B. Review of Courses

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to

approve the following courses, based on the initial review and recommendations by Chairperson Tanaka, Vice-Chairperson Benavente, and Ms. Yamamoto:

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning LLC

<u>Index #:</u>	<u>Course Title & Approved Hours</u>
22-138	Appraising Complex Properties with Unique Characteristics 3.5 CE
22-139	Learning Home Measurement – Video Series 5 CE
22-140	Appraiser Liability 101: Essential Concepts 4 CE
22-141	Appraiser’s Guide to Appraisal Inspection [Live Webinar] 7 CE
22-142	Appraiser’s Guide to Income Approach [Live Webinar] 7 CE
22-143	Appraiser’s Guide to FHA [Live Webinar] 7 CE
22-144	Diversifying Your Practice – Inside and Out [Live Webinar] 7 CE
22-145	Measuring with ANSI & the 2021 ANSI Update [Live Webinar] 4 CE

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Vice-Chairperson Benavente, and unanimously carried to ratify the approval of the following renewed and/or CAP approved courses:

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning LLC

<u>Index #:</u>	<u>Course Title & Approved Hours</u>
-----------------	--

22-146 2022-2023 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course
[classroom]
7 CE

Course Provider: Dynasty School

Index #: Course Title & Approved Hours

22-134 Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies
15 QE w/exam
15 CE w/exam
14 CE w/o exam

22-135 Real Estate Appraisal – Principles & Procedures
60 QE w/exam
60 CE w/exam
56 CE w/o exam

22-136 Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best
Use
15 QE w/exam
15 CE w/exam
14 CE w/o exam

22-137 Statistics, Modeling and Finance
15 QE w/exam
15 CE w/exam
14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: McKissock, LP

Index #: Course Title & Approved Hours

22-147 Live Webinar: Land and Site Valuation
5 CE

22-148 Fair Housing, Bias, and Discrimination [synchronous]
4 CE

Course Provider: OREP Education Network

22-149 How to Support and Prove Your Adjustments
7.5 CE w/exam

7 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index No.	Title	Hours
22-150	Online Measure It Right! - Using the ANSI-Z765-2021 Standard for Residential Properties [Asynchronous]	4 CE
22-151	2022-2023 7-Hour Equivalent USPAP Update Course	7 CE
22-152	2020-2021 15-Hour National USPAP Update Course [Asynchronous]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-153	Advanced Concepts and Case Studies	40 QE w/exam 40 CE w/exam 37 CE w/o exam
22-154	Advanced Concepts and Case Studies [synchronous]	40 QE w/exam 40 CE w/exam 37 CE w/o exam
22-155	Advanced Income Capitalization	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 33 CE w/o exam
22-156	Advanced Income Capitalization [synchronous]	33 QE w/exam 33 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
22-157	Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
22-158	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, Part I [classroom]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-159	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, Part I [synchronous]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-160	Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part II [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the April 6, 2022 Meeting
 Page 6

22-161	Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part II [synchronous]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-162	Advanced Spreadsheet Modeling for Valuation Applications	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-163	Online Analyzing Operating Expenses	7 CE
22-164	Application & Interpretation of Simple Linear Regression	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-165	Online Appraisal of Manufactured Homes and Next- Generation Manufactured Homes	8.5 CE w/exam 7.5 CE w/o exam
22-166	Online Appraisal of Medical Office Buildings	7 CE
22-167	Online Appraiser's Guide To Expert Witnessing	7 CE
22-168	Online Appraising Automobile Dealerships	7 CE
22-169	Appraising Condos, Co-ops, and PUDs	7 CE
22-170	Online Appraiser Condos, Co-ops, and PUDs	7 CE
22-171	Online Appraising Convenience Stores	7 CE
22-172	Basic Appraisal Principles [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-173	Online Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/ exam 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the April 6, 2022 Meeting
 Page 7

22-174	Basic Appraisal Principles [synchronous]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-175	Basic Appraisal Procedures [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-176	Online Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/ exam 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-177	Basic Appraisal Procedures [synchronous]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-178	Business Practices and Ethics	6 CE
22-179	Business Practice and Ethics [synchronous]	6 CE
22-180	Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
22-181	Condemnation Appraising: Principles and Applications	22 CE w/exam 21 CE w/o exam
22-182	Desktop Appraisals (Bifurcated, Hybrid) and Evaluations	7 CE
22-183	Fundamentals of Separating Real and Personal Property from Intangible Business Assets	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-184	General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 1 [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-185	General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 2 [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-186	General Appraiser Market Analysis Highest & Best Use [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the April 6, 2022 Meeting
 Page 8

22-187	General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-188	Online General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-189	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-190	Online General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-191	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-192	Getting it Right From The Start: A Workout Plan For Your Scope of Work	7 CE
22-193	Historic Preservation (Façade) Easements: Appraisal Techniques & Valuation Issues	7 CE
22-194	Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles and Concepts	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
22-195	Online Introduction to Green Buildings - Principles and Concepts	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
22-196	Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics & Applications	22.5 CE w/exam 21.5 CE w/o exam
22-197	Online Measure it Right-Using the ANSI-Z765-2013 Standard for Residential Properties	4 CE
22-198	Practical Applications in Appraising Green Commercial Properties	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-199	Quantitative Analysis	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the April 6, 2022 Meeting
 Page 9

22-200	Quantitative Analysis [synchronous]	32 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
22-201	Rapid Response: Market Analysis in Volatile Markets	7 CE
22-202	Online Rates and Ratios: Making Sense of GIMs, OARs and DCF	7 CE
22-203	Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-204	Online Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-205	Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-206	Online Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-207	Online Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-208	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-209	Online Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-210	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-211	Online Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-212	Online Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the April 6, 2022 Meeting
 Page 10

22-213	Review Case Studies - General	32 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
22-214	Review Case Studies - General [synchronous]	32 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
22-215	Review Case Studies - Residential	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-216	Review Case Studies - Residential [synchronous]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-217	Review Theory - General	33 QE w/exam 33 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
22-218	Review Theory General [synchronous]	33 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
22-219	Review Theory - Residential	17 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam
22-220	Review Theory - Residential [synchronous]	17 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam
22-221	Online Reviewing Residential Appraisals and Using Fannie Mae Form 2000	7 CE
22-222	Online Small Hotel / Motel Valuation: Limited-Service Lodging	7 CE
22-223	Online Subdivision Valuation	7 CE
22-224	Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course	5 CE w/ exam 4 CE w/o exam
22-225	Online Supervisory Appraiser-Trainee Appraiser Course	4 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the April 6, 2022 Meeting
 Page 11

22-226	Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course (Synchronous)	4 CE
22-227	The Appraiser as an Expert Witness: Preparation & Testimony	16 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam
22-228	Online Thinking Outside the Form	4 CE
22-229	Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-230	Online Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions	4 CE
22-231	Online Using Your HP 12C Financial Calculator	7 CE
22-232	Valuation of Conservation Easements	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-233	Online Valuation Resources for Photovoltaic Systems	3 CE
22-234	Practical Application of Fundamental Analysis	7 CE
22-235	Online - Expand Your Practice Arbitration Do's and Don'ts	7 CE
22-236	Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use [synchronous]	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam

C. Permitted Interaction Group

The Committee will consider establishing a Permitted Interaction Group (less than quorum) to: (1) review and discuss incorporating the Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal (“PAREA”)

program into the State of Hawaii Real Estate Appraiser Program; and (2) and consider possible amendments to Hawaii Revised Statutes Chapter 466K and Hawaii Administrative Rules Chapter 114.

The Permitted Interaction Group will present its recommendation to the Committee upon its completion.

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to create a Permitted Interaction Group to work with industry stakeholders and the public to: (1) review and discuss incorporating the Practical Applications of Real Estate Appraisal ("PAREA") program into the State of Hawaii Real Estate Appraiser Program; and (2) and consider possible amendments to Hawaii Revised Statutes Chapter 466K and Hawaii Administrative Rules Chapter 114. The Permitted Interaction Group will be facilitated by Executive Officer Takao (and DAG Paige as necessary) and comprised of Chairperson Tanaka, Vice-Chairperson Benavente, and Ms. Yamamoto.

Announcements: Executive Officer Takao reminded Committee members to file their annual financial disclosures to the Ethics Commission by May 30, 2022. The Ethics Commission emailed instructions on how to file on February 18, 2022 that was forwarded to all Committee members by Executive Officer Takao.

Next Meeting: Wednesday, June 1, 2022
10:00 a.m.
Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
HRH King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, First Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Adjournment: There being no further discussion, the meeting adjourned at 10:24 a.m.

Taken and recorded by:

/s/ Leanne Abe

Leanne Abe
Secretary

Reviewed and Approved by:

/s/ Sherman Takao

Sherman Takao
Executive Officer

ST:la

4/6/22

Minutes approved as is.

Minutes approved with changes. See Minutes of _____.