

REAL ESTATE APPRAISER ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Professional and Vocational Licensing Division
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs
State of Hawaii

MINUTES OF MEETING

- Date: February 2, 2022
- Time: 10:00 a.m.
- Place: Virtual Videoconference Meeting – Zoom Webinar
(use link below)
<https://dcca-hawaii-gov.zoom.us/j/99855406568>
- Present: Shelly H. Tanaka, Industry Member, Chairperson
Fernando Benavente, Industry Member, Vice-Chairperson
Aimee Yamamoto, Industry Member
Lars B. Larson, Public Member
Brian Brennan Financial Institution Member
James Paige, Deputy Attorney General (“DAG”)
Candace Ito, Acting Supervising Executive Officer, PVL, DCCA
Sherman Takao, Executive Officer
Leanne Abe, Secretary
- Excused: None.
- Guests: Scott DiBiasio
- Agenda: The agenda for this meeting was filed with the Office of the Lieutenant Governor, as required by Hawaii Revised Statutes (“HRS”) section 92-7(b).
- A brief video was played to explain procedures for this virtual meeting and how members of the public can participate and interact with the Committee during the meeting.
- Call to Order: There being a quorum present, the meeting was called to order at 10:10 a.m. by Chairperson Tanaka.
- Chairperson Tanaka proceeded with roll call. All Committee members were present.
- Election of Officers: Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

A. Chairperson

Chairperson Tanaka requested that Committee members could either indicate their interest in, or nominate member(s) for the position of Chairperson. Mr. Larson nominated Chairperson Tanaka for the position of Chairperson. Chairperson Tanaka expressed her interest in the position. No further members expressed an interest and no further nominations were made for the position of Chairperson. Mr. Benavente seconded the motion, and it was unanimously carried to re-elect Chairperson Tanaka as Chairperson.

B. Vice-Chairperson

Chairperson Tanaka requested that Committee members could either indicate their interest in, or nominate member(s) for the position of Vice-Chairperson. Mr. Larson nominated Mr. Benavente for the position of Vice-Chairperson. Mr. Benavente expressed his interest in the position. No further members expressed an interest and no further nominations were made for the position of Vice-Chairperson. Ms. Yamamoto seconded the motion, and it was unanimously carried to re-elect Mr. Benavente as Vice-Chairperson.

Approval of the
December 1, 2021
Meeting Minutes:

Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to approve the December 1, 2021 meeting minutes as circulated.

New Business:

Chairperson Tanaka asked if any members of the public would like to provide oral testimony on this agenda item. There were none.

At 10:19 a.m., it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried for the Committee to enter into Executive Session to consider and evaluate personal information relating to individuals applying for licensure in accordance with HRS section 92-5(a)(1), and to consult with the Committee's attorney on questions and issues pertaining to the Committee's powers, duties, privileges, immunities, and liabilities in accordance with HRS section 92-5(a)(4). (Note: Committee and staff moved to Teams.)

EXECUTIVE SESSION

At 10:35 a.m., the Committee returned to public session.

A. Review of Applications

- 1) Deava Farkash
 (Real Estate Appraiser Trainee / Apprentice)

After discussion, it was moved by Vice-Chairperson Benavente, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to approve the Real Estate Appraiser Trainee / Apprentice application of Deava Farkash.

B. Review of Courses

After discussion, it was moved by Chairperson Tanaka, seconded by Vice-Chairperson Benavente, and unanimously carried to ratify the approval of the following renewed and/or CAP approved courses:

Course Provider: OREP Education Network

Index No.	Title	Hours
22-010	FHA Appraisal Standards	7 CE
22-011	How to Raise Appraisal Quality and Minimize Risk	7 CE
22-012	Identifying and Correcting Appraisal Failures	7 CE

Course Provider: Appraiser eLearning LLC

Index No.	Title	Hours
------------------	--------------	--------------

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 4

22-013	Appraising 2-4 Unit MF Properties	7 CE
22-014	Public Records, Square Footage & the Real Estate Information Crisis	7 CE
22-015	Sales Comparison Approach: A Course on Analysis and Reporting	7 CE
22-016	Appraisers Guide to CYA (Covering Your Appraisal)	4 CE
22-017	Depreciated Replacement Cost	7 CE
22-018	Intro to Commercial Property Valuation	7 CE
22-019	ANSI, Home Measurement & the Power of Price Per Square Foot	7 CE

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index No.	Title	Hours
22-113	Historic Preservation (Façade) Easements: Appraisal Techniques & Valuation Issues	7 CE
22-114	2020-2021 15-Hour National USPAP Course [classroom]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Hawaii CCIM Chapter

Index No.	Title	Hours
22-115	CI 101 Financial Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 5

22-116	CI 102 Market Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE
22-117	CI 103 User Decision Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE
22-118	CI 104 Investment Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE

Course Provider: McKissock, LP

Index No.	Title	Hours
22-020	Live Webinar: 2020-2021 15-Hour USPAP Course	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-021	Live Webinar: Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-022	Live Webinar: Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-023	2020-2021 15-Hour National USPAP Course	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-024	2020-2021 15-Hour National USPAP Course [classroom]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-025	2022-2023 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course [classroom]	7 CE
22-026	2022-2023 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course [synchronous]	7 CE
22-027	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-028	Appraisal of Assisted Living Facilities	8 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 6

22-029	Appraisal of Fast Food Facilities	7 CE
22-030	Appraisal of Industrial and Flex Buildings	7 CE
22-031	Appraisal of Industrial Incubators	7 CE
22-032	Appraisal of Owner-Occupied Commercial Properties	7 CE
22-033	Appraisal of REO and Foreclosure Properties	7 CE
22-034	Appraisal of Self-Storage Facilities	7 CE
22-035	Appraisal Subject Matter Electives	20 QE w/exam20 CE w/exam18 CE w/o exam
22-036	Appraising Complex Residential Properties [Live Webinar]	3 CE
22-037	Appraising for the VA	5 CE
22-038	Appraising Small Apartment Properties	6 CE
22-039	Appraising Small Apartment Properties [Live Webinar]	4 CE
22-040	Appraising Today's Manufactured Homes	7 CE
22-041	Avoiding Mortgage Fraud for Appraisers	7 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 7

22-042	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-043	Basic Appraisal Principles [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-044	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-045	Basic Appraisal Procedures [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-046	Best Practices for Completing Bifurcated and Hybrid Appraisals	3 CE
22-047	Bifurcated and Hybrid Appraisal: A Practical Approach [classroom]	4 CE
22-048	Commercial Appraisal Review - Subject Matter Elective	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 13.5 CE w/o exam
22-049	Commercial Land Valuation	4 CE
22-050	Complex Properties: The Odd Side of Appraisal	7 CE
22-051	Diversify Your Appraisal With Assessment Appeals [classroom]	4 CE
22-052	Divorce and Estate Appraisals: Elements of Non-Lender Work	4 CE
22-053	Essential Elements of Disclosures and Disclaimers	5 CE
22-054	Evaluating Today's Residential Appraisal: Reliable Review	7 CE
22-055	Evaluations, Desktops, and Other Limited Scope Appraisals	4 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 8

22-056	Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers - Subject Matter Electives	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 13.5 CE w/o exam
22-057	Fannie Mae Appraisal Guidelines - Debunking the Myths	4 CE
22-058	Focus on FHA Minimum Property Requirements - Live Webinar	4 CE
22-059	Fundamentals of Expert Witness Testimony [classroom]	4 CE
22-060	General Appraiser Income Approach	60 QE w/exam 60 CE w/exam 55 CE w/o exam
22-061	General Appraiser Market Analysis Highest & Best Use	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-062	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-063	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-064	General Report Writing & Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-065	Green Building Concepts for Appraiser	7 CE
22-066	Income Approach Case Studies for Commercial Appraisal	4 CE
22-067	Intermediate Income Approach Case Studies for Commercial Appraisers	4 CE
22-068	Introduction to Commercial Appraisal Review	7 CE
22-069	Introduction to Expert Witness Testimony for Appraisers - To Do or Not To Do	4 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 9

22-070	Issues in Appraiser Liability - Live Webinar	4 CE
22-071	Land and Site Valuation	7 CE
22-072	Live Webinar: Diversify Your Practice With Assessment Appeals	4 CE
22-073	Live Webinar: Learning From the Mistakes of Others: Appraisal Disciplinary Case Studies	3 CE
22-074	Managing Appraiser Liability	6 CE
22-075	Market Disturbances [classroom]	4 CE
22-076	Market Disturbances - Appraisals in Atypical Markets and Cycles	3 CE
22-077	New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes	3 CE
22-078	New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes [classroom]	3 CE
22-079	Relocation Appraisal and the New ERC Form	6 CE
22-080	REO Appraisal: Guidelines and Best Practices Live Webinar	4 CE
22-081	Residential Appraisal Review and USPAP Compliance [internet]	7 CE
22-082	Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam15 CE w/exam14 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 10

22-083	Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach [classroom]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-084	Residential Construction and the Appraiser	7 CE
22-085	Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-086	Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use [classroom]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-087	Residential Property Inspection for Appraisers	7 CE
22-088	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-089	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies [classroom]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-090	Residential Report Writing: More Than Forms	7 CE
22-091	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
22-092	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
22-093	Statistics, Modeling and Finance	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
22-094	Supervisor - Trainee Course for Hawaii	4 CE
22-095	Supporting Adjustments: The Journey from Analysis to Adjusting	4 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 11

22-096	Supporting Your Adjustments - Methods for Residential Appraisers	3 CE
22-097	That's a Violation	4 CE
22-098	The Basics of Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers	7 CE
22-099	The Cost Approach	7 CE
22-100	The FHA Handbook 4000.1 [Classroom]	7 CE
22-101	The FHA Handbook 4000.1 [Internet]	7 CE
22-102	The Fundamentals of Appraising Luxury Homes	4 CE
22-103	The Income Approach: An Overview	7 CE
22-104	The Sales Comparison Approach	7 CE
22-105	Understanding Luxury Home Features	7 CE
22-106	Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions (Yellow Book) Course	14 CE
22-107	Using Appraisal Report Templates Responsibly	3 CE
22-108	Valuation of Residential Solar [classroom]	3 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 12

22-109	Valuation of Residential Green Buildings	4 CE
22-110	Valuation of Residential Solar	3 CE
22-111	Appraising Small Apartment Properties [classroom]	4 CE
22-112	Residential Property Inspection[Live Webinar]	3 CE
22-119	2022-2023 7-Hour National USPAP Update Course [synchronous]	7 CE
22-120	Live Webinar: Appraising Condominium Units [synchronous]	3 CE
22-121	Live Webinar: Bifurcated and Hybrid Appraisals: A Practical Approach [synchronous]	4 CE
22-122	Live Webinar: Diversify Your Appraisal Practice With Estate Appraisals [synchronous]	3 CE
22-123	Live Webinar: Fundamentals of Expert Witness Testimony [synchronous]	4 CE
22-124	Live Webinar: Market Disturbances - Market Analysis in Atypical Markets and Cycles [synchronous]	4 CE
22-125	Live Webinar: Measuring 1-4 Unit Residential Properties - With ANSI Z765 Standard [synchronous]	4 CE
22-126	Live Webinar: Mortgage Lending Appraisal Requirements: Fannie Mae and Freddie Mac [synchronous]	7 CE
22-127	Live Webinar: New Construction Essentials: Luxury Homes [synchronous]	3 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
 Minutes of the February 2, 2022 Meeting
 Page 13

22-128	Live Webinar: Residential Property Inspections: An Appraiser's Perspective [synchronous]	7 CE
22-129	Live Webinar: Supporting Adjustments: The Journey From Analysis to Adjusting [synchronous]	4 CE
22-130	Live Webinar: The Appraiser's Guide to HUD Handbook 4000.1 [synchronous]	7 CE
22-131	Live Webinar: The Fundamentals of Appraising Luxury Homes [synchronous]	4 CE
22-132	Live Webinar: Using Appraisal Report Templates Responsibly [synchronous]	3 CE
22-133	Live Webinar: Valuation of Residential Solar[synchronous]	3 CE

Announcements: None.

Next Meeting: Wednesday, April 6, 2022
 10:00 a.m.
 Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
 King Kalakaua Building
 335 Merchant Street, 1st Floor
 Honolulu, HI 96813
 (Virtual Videoconference Meeting / Zoom Webinar - TBD)

Adjournment: There being no further discussion, the meeting adjourned at 10:46 a.m.

Taken and recorded by:

/s/ Leanne Abe

Leanne Abe
 Secretary

Reviewed and Approved by:

/s/ Sherman Takao

Sherman Takao
Executive Officer

ST:la

2/5/22

Minutes approved as is.

Minutes approved with changes. See Minutes of _____.