

REAL ESTATE APPRAISER ADVISORY COMMITTEE

Professional and Vocational Licensing Division
Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs
State of Hawaii

MINUTES OF MEETING

The agenda for this meeting was filed with the Office of the Lieutenant Governor, as required by Section 92-7(b), Hawaii Revised Statutes.

Date: Wednesday, February 7, 2018

Time: 10:05 a.m.

Place: Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, 1st Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Present: Richard Stellmacher, Industry Member, Chairperson
Brian J. Walther, Industry Member, Vice-Chairperson
Lars B. Larson, Financial Institution Member
Shelly H. Tanaka, Industry Member
James Paige, Deputy Attorney General ("DAG")
Alan Taniguchi, Executive Officer
Lori Nishimura, Secretary

Excused: George Leong, Financial Institution Member

Guest: None.

Call to Order: There being a quorum present, the meeting was called to order at 10:05 a.m. by Chairperson Stellmacher.

Approval of the December 6, 2017 Meeting Minutes: After discussion, it was moved by Vice-Chairperson Walther, seconded by Mr. Larson, and unanimously carried to approve the December 6, 2017 meeting minutes as circulated.

New Business: a. Review of Courses

After discussion, it was moved by Vice-Chairperson Walther, seconded by Ms. Tanaka, and unanimously carried to approve the following courses, based on the initial review and recommendation by Vice-Chairperson Walther:

Course Provider: Allterra Group LLC

Index #: **Course Title & Approved Hours:**

18-116 2018 Appraisal Policy and Procedures
Charleston – March 21, 2018
7 CE

18-117 2018 Keynote
Charleston – March 20, 2018
7 CE

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index #: **Course Title & Approved Hours:**

18-088 Solving Land Valuation Puzzles
7 CE

After discussion, it was moved by Ms. Tanaka, seconded by Chairperson Stellmacher, and unanimously carried to ratify the approval of the following renewed and/or CAP approved courses:

Course Provider: Appraisal Institute

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-121	Advanced Concepts and Case Studies	40 QE w/exam 37 CE
18-122	Advanced Concepts and Case Studies [synchronous]	40 QE w/exam 40 CE w/exam 37 CE w/o exam
18-123	Advanced Income Capitalization	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
18-124	Advanced Income Capitalization [synchronous]	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the February 7, 2018 Meeting
Page 3

18-125	Advanced Land Valuation: Sound Solutions to Perplexing Problems	7 CE
18-126	Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
18-127	Advanced Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use [synchronous]	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
18-128	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, Part I	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-129	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies, Part I [synchronous]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-130	Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part II	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-131	Advanced Residential Report Writing, Part II [synchronous]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-132	Advanced Spreadsheet Modeling for Valuation Applications	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-133	Analyzing Tenant Credit Risk & Commercial Lease Analysis [synchronous]	7 CE
18-134	Application & Interpretation of Simple Linear Regression	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-135	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-136	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-137	Business Practices & Ethics	4 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the February 7, 2018 Meeting
Page 4

18-138	Case Studies in Appraising Green Commercial Buildings	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-139	Complex Litigation Appraisal Case Studies [synchronous]	7 CE
18-140	Condemnation Appraising: Principles and Applications	22 CE w/exam 21 CE w/o exam
18-141	Contract or Effective Rent: Finding the Real Rent [synchronous]	4 CE
18-142	FHA Appraising for Valuation Professionals	7 CE
18-143	Fundamentals of Separating Real and Personal Property from Intangible Business Assets	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-144	General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 1	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-145	General Appraiser Income Approach, Part 2	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-146	General Appraiser Market Analysis Highest & Best Use [classroom]	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-147	General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-148	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-149	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-150	Introduction to Green Buildings: Principles and Concepts	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam

18-151	Litigation Appraising: Specialized Topics & Applications	16 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam
18-152	Online Analyzing Operating Expenses	7 CE
18-153	Online Appraisal of Medical Office Buildings	7 CE
18-154	Online Appraising Convenience Stores	7 CE
18-155	Online Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/ exam 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-156	Online Business Practices and Ethics	5 CE
18-157	Online Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/ exam 30 CE w/ exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-158	Online Case Studies in Appraising Green Commercial Buildings	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-159	Online Case Studies in Appraising Green Residential Buildings	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
18-160	Online Comparative Analysis	7 CE
18-161	Online AI's Cool Tools: New Technology for Real Estate Appraisers	7 CE
18-162	Online Data Verification Methods	5 CE
18-163	Online Eminent Domain & Condemnation	7 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the February 7, 2018 Meeting
Page 6

18-164	Online FHA Appraising - Principles and Procedures	7 CE
18-165	Online Forecasting Revenue	7 CE
18-166	Online General Appraiser Income Approach Part 1	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-167	Online General Appraiser Income Approach Part 2	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-168	Online General Appraiser Report Writing and Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-169	Online General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-170	Online General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-171	Online Introduction to Green Buildings - Principles and Concepts	8 CE w/exam 7 CE w/o exam
18-172	Online Rates and Ratios: Making Sense of GIMs, OARs and DCF	7 CE
18-173	Online Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-086	Online Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-174	Online Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-175	Online Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the February 7, 2018 Meeting
Page 7

18-176	Online Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-177	Online Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-178	Online Reviewing Residential Appraisals and Using Fannie Mae Form 2000	7 CE
18-179	Online Small Hotel / Motel Valuation: Limited-Service Lodging	7 CE
18-180	Online Subdivision Valuation	7 CE
18-181	Online Supervisory Appraiser-Trainee Appraiser Course	4 CE
18-182	Online The Discounted Cash Flow Model - Concepts, Issues, & Applications	5 CE
18-183	Online Thinking Outside the Form	4 CE
18-184	Online Using Your HP 12C Financial Calculator	7 CE
18-185	Practical Applications in Appraising Green Commercial Properties	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-186	Quantitative Analysis	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
18-187	Quantitative Analysis [synchronous]	35 QE w/exam 35 CE w/exam 32 CE w/o exam
18-188	Real Estate Finance, Statistics, and Valuation Modeling	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

18-189	Residential Applications Part 2	7 CE
18-190	Residential Applications: Using Technology to Measure and Support Assinment Results	7 CE
18-191	Residential and Commercial Valuation of Solar	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-192	Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-193	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-194	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-195	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-196	Review Case Studies - General	32 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
18-197	Review Case Studies - Residential	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-198	Review Case Studies - Residential [synchronous]	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-199	Review Theory - General	33 QE w/exam 33 CE w/exam 30 CE w/o exam
18-200	Review Theory - Residential	17 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam
18-201	Review Theory - Residential [synchronous]	17 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam

18-202	Supervisory Appraiser / Trainee Appraiser Course	5 CE w/ exam 4 CE w/o exam
18-203	The Appraiser as an Expert Witness: Preparation & Testimony	16 CE w/exam 15 CE w/o exam
18-204	Two Day Advanced Income Capitalization/A	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-205	Two Day Advanced Income Capitalization/B	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-206	Uniform Appraisal Standards for Federal Land Acquisitions	15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-207	Using Spreadsheet Programs in Real Estate Appraisals - Synchronous Version	7 CE
18-208	Valuation in Challenging Markets	30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-209	Valuation of Conservation Easements	30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Calypso Continuing Educaiton

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-100	A Brief Historic Stroll Through America's Architectural Styles	7 CE
18-101	Appraising Energy Efficient Residential Properties	8 CE
18-102	Construction Details, Concept to Completion	7 CE

18-103	Environmental Hazards Impact on Value	7 CE
18-104	FHA Site Inspection for Appraisers	7 CE
18-115	2018-2019 7-Hour National USPAP Update Equivalent Course	7 CE

Course Provider: **OnCourse Learning Corporation**
d.b.a. Career Webschool

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-076	Appraisal Math and Statistics	7 CE
18-077	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-078	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-079	Cost Approach Overview	7 CE
18-080	Income Capitalization Overview	7 CE
18-081	Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-082	Residential Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

18-083	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 29 CE w/o exam
18-084	Sales Comparison Approach	7 CE

Course Provider: Dynasty School

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-087	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: Hawaii CCIM Chapter

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-072	CI 101 Financial Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE
18-073	CI 102 Market Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE
18-074	CI 103 User Decision Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE

18-075	CI 104 Investment Analysis for Commercial Investment Real Estate [classroom]	34 CE
--------	--	-------

Course Provider: Hondros College of Business

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-105	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-089	Appraisal Review of Residential Properties	7 CE
18-090	Basic Construction Review	7 CE
18-106	Basic Residential Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-107	Basic Residential Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-091	Better to be Safe Than Sorry	7 CE
18-092	Challenging Assignments for Residential Appraisers	7 CE
18-093	Defensible Appraising	7 CE
18-094	FHA and VA Today	7 CE
18-095	Green in Residences and Appraisals	7 CE
18-108	Market Analysis and Highest and Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-096	Methodology and Application of Sales Comparison	7 CE

18-109	National Appraising for the Supervisor and Trainee	4 CE
18-097	Property and Valuation Analysis for FHA	7 CE
18-110	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-111	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-112	Residential Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-113	Specialized Residential Appraisal Topics	20 QE w/exam 20 CE w/exam 19 CE w/o exam
18-114	Statistics, Modeling and Finance	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

Course Provider: McKissock, LP

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-001	2018-2019 7-hour National USPAP Update Course	7 CE
18-043	2018-2019 7-hour National USPAP Update Course [classroom]	7 CE
18-070	2018-2019 7-hour USPAP Update for Non-Residential Property	7 CE
18-071	2018-2019 National 15-hour USPAP Update Course	15 CE
18-002	A Review of Disciplinary Cases - Live Webinar	3 CE
18-003	A Review of Disciplinary Cases: How to Avoid a Visit with the Licensing Board	3 CE
18-004	Adjustment Support for Residential Appraisers - Live Webinar	4 CE
18-005	Advanced Hotel Appraising - Full Service Hotels	7 CE
18-006	Advanced Residential Applications and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam

18-007	Analyze This! Applications of Appraisal Analysis (Live Webinar)	4 CE
18-008	Appraisal of Assisted Living Facilities	8 CE
18-009	Appraisal of Fast Food Facilities	7 CE
18-010	Appraisal of Industrial Incubators	7 CE
18-011	Appraisal of Land Subject to Ground Leases	7 CE
18-012	Appraisal of Owner-Occupied Commercial Properties	7 CE
18-013	Appraisal of REO and Foreclosure Properties	7 CE
18-014	Appraisal of Self-Storage Facilities	7 CE
18-015	Appraisal of Single Tenant Distribution Centers	6 CE
18-016	Appraisal Practices of Manufactured Housing - Live Webinar	4 CE
18-017	Appraisal Subject Matter Electives	20 QE w/exam 20 CE w/exam 18 CE w/o exam
18-018	Appraising Small Apartment Properties	6 CE
18-119	Appraising Small Apartment Properties [Live Webinar]	4 CE

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the February 7, 2018 Meeting
Page 17

18-019	Avoiding Mortgage Fraud for Appraisers	7 CE
18-020	Basic Appraisal Principles	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-021	Basic Appraisal Procedures	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-022	Basic Hotel Appraising - Limited Service Hotels	7 CE
18-023	Commercial Appraisal Review - Subject Matter Elective	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 13.5 CE w/o exam
18-024	Complex Properties: The Odd Side of Appraisal	7 CE
18-025	Divorce and Estate Appraisals: Elements of Non-Lender Work	4 CE
18-026	Essential Elements of Disclosures and Disclaimers	5 CE
18-027	Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers - Subject Matter Electives	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 13.5 CE w/o exam
18-028	Expert Witness Testimony: To Do or Not To Do - Live Webinar	4 CE
18-029	Fannie Mae Appraisal Guidelines - Debunking the Myths	4 CE
18-030	Fannie Mae Appraisal Guidelines - Live Webinar	4 CE
18-031	Fundamental Concepts of Analysis	7 CE
18-032	General Appraiser Income Approach	60 QE w/exam 60 CE w/exam 55 CE w/o exam

Real Estate Appraiser Advisory Committee
Minutes of the February 7, 2018 Meeting
Page 18

18-033	General Appraiser Market Analysis Highest & Best Use	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-034	General Appraiser Sales Comparison Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-035	General Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 28 CE w/o exam
18-036	General Report Writing & Case Studies	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-037	Income Approach Case Studies for Commercial Appraisal	4 CE
18-118	Intermediate Income Approach Case Studies for Commercial Appraisers	4 CE
18-038	Introduction to Expert Witness Testimony for Appraisers - To Do or Not To Do	4 CE
18-039	Introduction to Legal Descriptions	2 CE
18-040	Issues in Appraiser Liability - Live Webinar	4 CE
18-041	Land and Site Valuation	7 CE
18-042	Managing Appraiser Liability	6 CE
18-120	Manufactured Home Appraisal	4 CE
18-044	Recognizing Mortgage Fraud and It's Effects - Live Webinar	4 CE

18-045	Relocation Appraisal and the New ERC Form	6 CE
18-046	REO Appraisal: Guidelines and Best Practices Live Webinar	4 CE
18-047	Residential Appraisal Review and USPAP Compliance	7 CE
18-048	Residential Appraiser Site Valuation and Cost Approach	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-049	Residential Market Analysis and Highest & Best Use	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-050	Residential Property Inspection for Appraisers	7 CE
18-051	Residential Report Writing and Case Studies	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-052	Residential Report Writing: More Than Forms	7 CE
18-053	Residential Sales Comparison and Income Approaches	30 QE w/exam 30 CE w/exam 27 CE w/o exam
18-054	Statistics, Modeling and Finance	15 QE w/exam 15 CE w/exam 14 CE w/o exam
18-055	Supervisor - Trainee Course for Hawaii	4 CE
18-056	Supporting Your Adjustments - Methods for Residential Appraisers	3 CE
18-057	That's a Violation	4 CE
18-058	The Basics of Expert Witness for Commercial Appraisers	7 CE

18-059	The Cost Approach	7 CE
18-060	The Dirty Dozen	3 CE
18-061	The FHA Handbook 4000.1 [Classroom]	7 CE
18-062	The FHA Handbook 4000.1 [Internet]	7 CE
18-063	The FHA Handbook 4000.1 [Live Webinar]	5 CE
18-064	The Income Approach: An Overview	7 CE
18-065	The Nuts & Bolts of Green Building for Appraisers	3 CE
18-066	The Sales Comparison Approach	7 CE
18-067	Understanding Residential Construction	7 CE
18-068	Work File: Your Best Defense Against an Offense - Live Webinar	5 CE
18-069	Workfile Documentation for Appraisers	4 CE

Course Provider: OREP Education Network

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-098	How to Support and Prove Your Adjustments	7 CE w/exam 6.5 CE w/o exam
18-099	FHA Appraisal Standards	7 CE

Course Provider: Steinley Real Estate Appraisals

Index No.	Title	Hours
18-085	2018-2019 National 7-hour USPAP Update Course [classroom - 03/05/2018]	7 CE

Announcements: Executive Officer Taniguchi informed the Committee of the results of the Program's bi-annual audit conducted by the Appraisal SubCommittee; the Program was rated as excellent.

Executive Officer Taniguchi distributed copies of the Appraiser Qualifications ("AQB"), The Appraisal Foundation's *Real Property Appraiser Qualification Criteria, Summary of Changes, Effective May 1, 2018*. He summarized the changes - AQB will revert the education requirement to its original requirement for State Licensed Appraiser (no college-level education required) and Certified Residential Appraiser (Associates Degree or in lieu of college credits). The Program has two years to change and incorporate the changes into Hawaii Administrative Rules ("HAR") Chapter 114. He also stated that although the HAR may not be amended in time of

the effective date, the new education requirement will be made a policy; thus, will be effective May 1, 2018.

Next Meeting: Wednesday, April 4, 2018
10:00 a.m.
Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room
King Kalakaua Building
335 Merchant Street, 1st Floor
Honolulu, Hawaii 96813

Adjournment: There being no further discussion, the meeting adjourned at
10:13 a.m.

Taken and recorded by:

/s/ Lori Nishimura

Lori Nishimura
Secretary

Reviewed and Approved by:

/s/ Alan Taniguchi

Alan Taniguchi
Executive Officer

AT:ln

02/26/18

[x] Minutes approved as is.

[] Minutes approved with changes. See Minutes of _____.