## CABLE ADVISORY COMMITTEE ("CAC") DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE AND CONSUMER AFFAIRS STATE OF HAWAII

## **MINUTES OF MEETING**

Date: Friday, February 2, 2018

Time: 5:00 p.m. – 8:37 p.m.

Place: Queen Liliuokalani Conference Room

Department of Commerce & Consumer Affairs

335 Merchant Street, 1st Floor

Honolulu, HI 96813

CAC MEMBERS: Gerry Silva, Tim Bryan, and Scott K. Wong

OTHERS: Catherine P. Awakuni Colón, Director; Ji Sook Kim, CATV

Administrator; Glen Chock, CATV Staff; Jamie Sheu, CATV Staff

Attorney; and Kyle Kagihara, CATV Staff Attorney

AGENDA: The agenda for this meeting was filed with the Office of the

Lieutenant Governor.

I. Call to Order – The meeting was called to order at 5:00 p.m.

II. Minutes of October 19, 2017 Meeting – There were no questions about the minutes, which were then accepted by the CAC.

## III. New Business

A. Charter/OTWC's Migration of Public, Educational and Governmental ("PEG") Access Channels Related to the Digital Transition

Director Awakuni Colón introduced the matter by stating that Decision and Order No. 366, issued by the Department of Commerce and Consumer Affairs ("DCCA") on December 17, 2015, provides that Charter Communications ("Charter")/Oceanic Time Warner Cable ("OTWC"), also known as Spectrum, shall undergo an all-digital network transition throughout all its cable franchise areas in the State of Hawaii by November 10, 2018. As part of this digital transition Charter/OTWC is required to provide, among other things, at least thirty (30) days' notice of the transition to affected areas and up to two (2) digital transport adapters ("DTAs") or "basic boxes" upon request, depending on the level of service.

Director Awakuni Colón stated that according to Charter/OTWC, the digital transition on Oahu will begin on February 6, 2018, and be completed around the first week of June with the transition of the neighbor islands to follow shortly thereafter.

On January 5, 2018, DCCA received a letter from Charter/OTWC regarding the digital transition and Charter/OTWC's plan to change channel placement of the PEG Access Channels managed by 'Ōlelo Community Media ("'Ōlelo") from channels 48, 49, 50, 52, 53, 54 and 55 to new locations at digital channels 181, 182, 183, 184, 185, 186 and 187.

On January 22, 2018, DCCA sent a letter to Charter/OTWC requesting an explanation for the reason behind the PEG channel movement, including the following items: 1) the possibility of leaving the channels where they are today; 2) clarification as to what channels will be available through DTAs; 3) confirmation that all subscribers will have access to the PEG Access Channels once the digital transition is complete; and 4) whether the notice letter to Charter/OTWC customers contained inaccurate information.

Charter/OTWC responded to DCCA's January 22, 2018 letter on January 29, 2018.

On February 1, 2018, DCCA issued a Letter Order expressing its concern over the movement of the PEG Access Channels and the impacts such a change will have on communities in Hawaii. In the Letter Order, DCCA found Charter/OTWC's digital transition notice to be defective due to inaccuracies relayed about the DTAs in the notice sent to subscribers who are scheduled to be transitioned starting on February 6, 2018. In addition, DCCA stated that the digital transition may not occur until thirty (30) days have passed from the time an accurate or corrected notice is received by subscribers that are impacted.

Gregg Fujimoto, President for Charter/OTWC, made the presentation to the CAC members, staff, and audience. Mr. Fujimoto introduced himself; Myoung Oh, Director, State Government Affairs; and Kiman Wong, Director, Wireless and Government Affairs at Charter/OTWC.

Mr. Fujimoto explained that Charter/OTWC is upgrading its cable system to provide all-digital service that will improve picture quality, increase broadband internet capabilities, expand to unserved areas, provide more WIFI hotspots, and broadcast more local sports and school events. Charter/OTWC is planning to begin digital transition on Oahu starting

February 6, 2018 through June 2018. The neighbor islands will complete their digital transition by November 2018.

Mr. Fujimoto further explained that customers will experience better picture and sound quality, with an enhanced program guide and search capabilities. He noted that the digital transition will increase broadband Internet speeds, improve service quality on digital boxes through two-way communication, and add 70 new channels.

Mr. Fujimoto stated that with 70 new channels, there will be shifts in channel locations which is not limited to PEG channels. PEG viewers will still be able to easily access PEG channels and the migration of channels will attempt to cluster similar channels together. According to Mr. Fujimoto, PEG channels will be clustered with news channels, which should capture new viewers for PEG channels.

After explaining the benefits of the digital transition, Mr. Fujimoto took the opportunity to correct the "misinformation" that has been circulating. Mr. Fujimoto wanted to let CAC members, staff, and audience know that Charter/OTWC is not slamming or hiding PEG channels. PEG channels, according to Mr. Fujimoto, will be lower than 70% of the channels that Charter/OTWC carries and can be easily located through the channel guide. Mr. Fujimoto made it clear that Charter/OTWC is not silencing PEG organizations and that PEG channels will be migrated near popular cable channels. PEG channels will still be available on the basic service tier and Charter/OTWC does not control content. PEG channels can be viewed and accessed by all subscribers, including those with DTAs. Like Hawaiian Telcom, digital cable technology does require equipment and is not unique to the PEG access channels. Subscribers will get up to 2 set top boxes at no cost for up to 2 years, depending on the level of service.

Mr. Fujimoto went on to state that to help ease the transition process and continue the digital transition on February 6<sup>th</sup>, at that time, Charter/OTWC is willing to offer `Ōlelo a 60-day delay in channel migration, new notice letters to resolve the confusion, on-screen messages informing viewers of the channel migration, and financial support to rebrand. Mr. Fujimoto concluded his presentation by stating that Charter/OTWC wants to demonstrate support and provide clearer understanding about where PEG channels can be found after the transition.

After Mr. Fujimoto's presentation, the CAC members were given an opportunity to ask Mr. Fujimoto questions. Mr. Silva asked how much bandwidth will Charter/OTWC get back from the transition since PEG channels are analog. Mr. Fujimoto responded that the use of the newly

available bandwidth will be a mixture of high definition ("HD") video, increased broadband, and provide more video-on-demand ("VOD") channels. Mr. Silva clarified his questions and asked Mr. Fujimoto to specifically address what PEG channels will receive, especially in terms of HD for PEGs. Mr. Fujimoto stated that HD for PEG channels is open for discussion. Mr. Silva asked if Charter/OTWC was worried about alienating four mayors and county councils. Mr. Fujimoto responded that he was focused on getting information to the CAC members.

Mr. Bryan asked if a better public relations campaign could have been undertaken and if the process was rushed. Mr. Fujimoto responded that the digital transition was a long process and commitments were made to DCCA to finish by November 2018. Mr. Bryan asked if earlier advertisement, such as 3 months ago, could have been done. Mr. Fujimoto stated that they believed 30-day notice would be sufficient. Mr. Bryan questioned Charter/OTWC actions because it seemed to upset the community. Mr. Fujimoto explained that it was not Charter/OTWC's intent. Charter/OTWC is trying to learn from the situation and will be providing enhanced notice. Finally, Mr. Bryan asked about ad insertion capabilities to aid in notice. Mr. Fujimoto responded that he will keep that suggestion open.

Mr. Wong asked if moving channels is needed for the digital transition. Mr. Fujimoto responded that clustering and grooming channels are done to make way for increased HD, VOD, and Internet speeds. Mr. Wong asked if channels 49 – 55 will disappear. Mr. Fujimoto stated that new channels will be in those slots, and reiterated that better communication will be needed when the change occurs, but there will likely be a 60-day delay. Mr. Bryan asked which programs would be in the current PEG slots which Mr. Fujimoto responded that once an agreement is made they will provide that information.

Mr. Bryan commented that Charter/OTWC did not think things through. Mr. Fujimoto added that there is an offer to freeze PEG channel locations for 60 days.

Mr. Wong asked about PEG channel movement on neighbor islands. Mr. Fujimoto responded that the PEG channels would be moved as a cluster so there won't be any differentiation between each Island's channels.

Mr. Bryan requested more information regarding moving PEG channels to the news cluster. Mr. Fujimoto answered by stating that below the PEG channels will be CNN and MSNBC, and above the PEG channels will be ESPN and other sports channels. Mr. Silva asked why PEG channels are to be moved if space is on parity. Mr. Fujimoto responded that the move will provide easier channel searches. Mr. Silva then asked why PEG channels would not be allowed to be with local channels. Mr. Fujimoto responded that PEGs are preeminent local programming and will not be alienated from other local programming. Mr. Silva asked why PEG channels cannot be clustered with the local broadcast channels. Mr. Fujimoto answered by stating that the NBC channel and other similar channels are not local, but national affiliates. Mr. Fujimoto stated that Charter/OTWC wants a seamless transition and does not want PEG channels to lose viewership.

Mr. Bryan asked why Charter/OTWC would make the change when everyone knows where the PEG channels are currently located. Mr. Fujimoto responded that many channels will experience migration, and PEG channels are not being singled.

Mr. Silva asked how many channels would be moving. Mr. Fujimoto stated that along with other channels, they are also moving their own channels, OC16, OC Sport, X-cast and all other OC products will be moving.

Mr. Bryan asked if the PEG channel migration will get the same amount of promotion and funding as the OC channel migrations. Mr. Fujimoto responded that he does not know what is being provided for the OC moves or the promotional budget for those channels.

Mr. Wong asked where will OC16 channel moving to. Mr. Fujimoto stated that it would from channel 12 back to channel16, and the other OC channels will be in that area.

Mr. Bryan asked if OC Sports will be clustered with the sports channels. Mr. Fujimoto responded that he did not know. Mr. Bryan commented that questions regarding channel migration details are not being answered. Mr. Fujimoto added that efforts are being made, but valuation to compare between one's private property and `Ōlelo is difficult.

Mr. Wong commented that Charter/OTWC as a corporation has the right to manage as it sees fit, but it comes down to a moral decision to ask if it is for the good of the people. In the future Charter/OTWC needs to really evaluate things and consider making offers to facilitate the transition.

Director Awakuni Colón transitioned the meeting to allow audience comment and explained the process by which comments would be received.

Robert Guarino began by stating that he took classes at `Ōlelo, and learned how to use equipment, produce, and direct. He learned so much, and now he is creating tv shows. `Ōlelo has fulfilled a dream because he can work on music related shows. Mr. Guarino does not want to see the channels change because people with basic cable can't go to the channels in the 180s.

Avery Jenkins presented written comments from the Mayor of Maui County, Akakū - Maui Community Television ("Akakū") CEO, and his own. Mr. Jenkins commented that this was a matter of trust, just like the thirty-meter telescope. Mr. Jenkins thinks outsiders displace trusting people and that this is a situation of mistrust. Mr. Jenkins does not trust PEG channels being near mainstream news, since trust in mainstream media is low and therefore this is not prime real estate, and going up against paid sports channels like the NFL channel which people do not have money for. Mr. Jenkins questioned the consideration for local people.

Kat Tracey opposed the "discretionary" decision to move `Ōlelo's channels to erroneous clusters. `Ōlelo has established its identity for years. Ms. Tracey questions why `Ōlelo is not being treated like PBS Hawaii or locally originated broadcast channels. Ms. Tracey commented that Charter/OTWC is fracturing community access audiences to earn more money. 60 days is not enough time to rebrand without losing clients and audience. DCCA-Cable Television Division ("CATV") is a part of the problem because of lame and vague franchise terms despite public testimony. The State is in bed with Charter/OTWC for tax money. All content is being produced in access centers in HD, and Ms. Tracey questions if HD will ever come to PEG channels because her shows do not look good. Lack of HD will make PEG channels obsolete and noncompetitive, with the message that community stories are second rate. Ms. Tracey stated that CATV kowtowing is annoying. Ms. Tracey closed by stating that we need to keep the aloha spirit for the Hawaii people.

Sanford Inouye, President/CEO, `Ōlelo, stated that Charter/OTWC was to discuss all-digital plan with PEG organization, but no meeting occurred. Instead, a letter was sent to inform `Ōlelo of the Charter/OTWC's channel movement plan. Mr. Inouye stated the 30-days' notice is impractical and impossible. Mr. Inouye added that `Ōlelo has a good relationship with the local Charter/OTWC and was hoping for a good relationship with Charter

corporate. `Ōlelo sent a letter regarding the "channel slam", but `Ōlelo has not received a reply from Charter Corporate about its national strategy. Mr. Inouye commented that Charter Corporate does not care about PEG access as shown by their track record of channel slamming PEG access channels in other states. Mr. Inouye clarified that his comments have nothing to do with digital migration because `Ōlelo is already using a digital format. Instead, Mr. Inouye points to channels with high numbers moving down into the double-digit category because Charter Corporate is only looking for commercial gain. Mr. Inouye commented that Charter Corporate is creating a barrier to PEG accessibility by having to pay for boxes. Mr. Inouye brought up the defective notice and asked the CAC members to challenge Charter Corporate legal right to move `Ōlelo 's channels because as it stands `Ōlelo will lose viewership if placed in "digital Siberia." Mr. Inouye called for the protection of public interest.

J Robertson, Executive Director, Ho`ike – Kaua`i Community Television, Inc. ("Ho`ike"), is against the movement of channels. Mr. Robertson commented that Charter/OTWC is recapturing analog and turning it into revenue generating opportunity. Mr. Robertson noted that there is currently no programming in the 170's or 190's channels. Mr. Robertson added that sports channels are paid platforms, so PEG channels need to be near local channels. PEG channels were originally in channels 10 – 13, now they are in the 50's. PEG channels are just a pawn in the process. Mr. Robertson commented that Spectrum did not move the PEG channels in Los Angeles. Mr. Robertson closed by stating that public interest, consumers, and the values of Hawaii are key and that Charter/OTWC needs to value its customers.

John Martin began by stating that `Ōlelo has grown considerably. Mr. Martin added that his neighbors want to see his `Ōlelo show. Mr. Martin also mention that he has been told that he needs a new HD tv to watch digital cable. Mr. Martin questioned the benefits of channel movement and asked if there are any alternatives.

Micah Alameda appeared on behalf of Stacy Higa, President/CEO, Nā Leo. Mr. Alameda stated that Mr. Higa submitted written testimony. As marketing manager for Nā Leo, Mr. Alameda can see Nā Leo's good work. Mr. Alameda stated that marketing *keiki's* talent is fulfilling. Nā Leo can meet the demands that Charter will not, like filming local high school sports on Hawaii island. Nā Leo is public access, and there is no other way you can be a normal citizen and air a program on cable television than through public access.

Larry Gellar commented that Hawaii has a reputation of doing the right thing. DCCA has power because franchise agreements have not been signed on the neighbor islands. Mr. Gellar stated that channel migration is harmful because the cancellation of analog is not technically needed, it is for money. Mr. Gellar added that seniors will lose access because they may not be able to install the cable box and the installation costs are expensive. Mr. Gellar closed by stating that his program has been on every night for 14 years and Charter/OTWC should leave the channels alone.

Kaeu Hussey, a producer and volunteer with `Ōlelo who now does professional work, commented that moving `Ōlelo will impact producers and volunteers. It will make it hard for them to get their message out. People trust `Ōlelo and moving PEG channels will only cause harm.

Steve Arashiro of the Hawaii United Okinawan Association stated that his program, Hawaii Okinawa Today, has been on 'Ōlelo for 20 years. A change in channels will cause chaos. Mr. Arashiro added that there is no technical reason for the change and PEG channels should remain.

Dustin Malama fears that viewership will drop and `Ōlelo will go off the air if PEG channels move. Mr. Malama commented that `Ōlelo is part of the culture. It gives access and information to people who wouldn't ordinarily get that information. Mr. Malama pointed out that news stations were invited to attend, but none have showed up. Mr. Malama stated that Spectrum is a monopoly since in many neighborhoods there is no other choice and called upon `Ōlelo producers to face up to Spectrum and tell them what they want.

George Berish spoke of his experience as a 16-year-old college physicist, but without money to continue his education he enlisted in the Army and was awarded a Bronze Star. Mr. Berish was an actuary for 35 years and now retired. Mr. Berish stated that Hawaii is becoming everyone else's marketplace. Spectrum is a public utility and should be accountable. 'Ōlelo is the only place left that is open to everybody.

Renee Ing, an `Ōlelo producer of News & Views, commented that Spectrum uses public rights of ways and in return is required to give back to the community. The public TV platform will be hidden and cannot be reached if PEG channels move. The move will silence `Ōlelo and the platform where `Ōlelo is slated to move to will prevent viewers from watching `Ōlelo because of the cost of the subscription.

Jacob Kambis is amazed by the technology, but concerned about when the dust settles. Mr. Kambis produced documentaries with the assistance of Scotty Wong. 'Ōlelo launched Mr. Kambis' new career. 'Ōlelo needs a stable platform and should be kept at its current channel locations. Mr. Kambis commented that 'Ōlelo cannot expand and improve if every 3 years external sources disrupt it.

Elaine Kam stated that `Ōlelo is a friendly institution, part of our identity and that she wants to keep `Ōlelo as it is.

Jack DeFeo is concerned that this proposed move does not serve anyone but Spectrum. Mr. DeFeo stated that the community was not given an opportunity to rally and understand the direction Spectrum would like to take, and that Spectrum has not addressed Hawaii's culture of aloha, the spirit of good intent. Mr. DeFeo questioned why Spectrum would want to disrupt 'Ōlelo, and despite the input thinks that 60 days later Spectrum will do it anyway.

Roy Nakamura commented that the Spectrum plan is terrible. The boxes are free for the first year, but will be \$8/month thereafter. Fixed income seniors will be affected. Mr. Nakamura commented that Spectrum needs to change the plan, or get out.

Deanna Espinas with Hawaii Plantation Village commented that DCCA has a big job as the voice of the community, taxpayers, and she will be regularly evaluating this issue to determine if it is meeting the needs of the public.

Ronald Higa commented that `Ōlelo provides good access for those that cannot go to neighborhood board meetings. Mr. Higa suggested Spectrum add the number one to `Ōlelo 's current channels so they become 149, 150, and 152.

Dr. Chris Gamarillo is a producer with `Ōlelo who pointed out that `Ōlelo lost hundreds of viewers years ago because TVs did not go past channel 13. Questioned what happened to the 10% of the channels `Ōlelo is supposed to get. Dr. Gamarillo commented that DCCA has not held Spectrum to task. The people own the land and the poles that Spectrum uses. The channels that will replace `Ōlelo in the channel lineup regularly bash the people of Hawaii. The people need more channels that show uplifting cultural and awareness of government forums. Dr. Gamarillo closed by stating that Hawaii is being outpriced for something taxes already paid for and Spectrum's plan is a bad move.

Tatianna Young commented that the digital displacement is not *pono*. It is unjust. This is one of the few media digital repositories to share the beauty of the culture and have a dialog for exchange. 'Ōlelo is an important resource and DCCA has an important job to protect this resource.

Reverend Helen Brock produces a program on `Ōlelo. Rev. Brock opened by stating that the supernatural nation of Hawaii should come back, the Hawaiian identity is being taken away and outsiders take away the sacred land. The Lord needs to bring back the land. Ms. Brock commented that God is love, and God loves the Hawaiian people and does not want people coming in to take their land. Hawaiian people need to act, not physically, but spiritually. Rev. Brock closed by asking the audience to join her religious group at Kawaiaha'o Church.

Cadence Kuuwa wants to keep `Ōlelo as standard channels to keep children's voices heard.

Kiara Kaleiwahea commented that people will not know about `Ōlelo if the channels are changed.

Phillip John Pall does not want the `Ōlelo channel change because Nanakuli only has standard cable.

Treasure Lewis commented that she wants to watch `Ōlelo but does not have the new channel. She does not want their voices shut out and requests that Spectrum not be a bully.

Kiani Lapera does not want 'Ōlelo to move. 'Ōlelo advances community engagement. If the channels are moved to "digital Siberia" island voices will be silenced and not everyone can afford digital.

Kawena Malo wants to keep `Ōlelo as standard channels and to not move them since most people have standard tv.

Kahealani Mano does not want `Ōlelo to move to areas of less population. It is not fair to crush children's dreams of making a change in the world.

Cyler Lopes does not want 'Olelo to move because parents want to see their kids on TV.

Choon James stated that this is a basic social contract with public access and the public that began in the 1970s. Public access prevents communities from being swallowed up by cable networks. Expectation is

that Spectrum should be the strongest advocate of public access to make the consumer happy. Moving the channels will create confusion and irritation. Producers spend their time and money because they believe open access and transparent government are important to a democratic society.

Brian Viola, media teacher at King Intermediate School, commented that `Ōlelo is a path to express messages and voices of youth that need to be heard. Spectrum will make more money from the plan, it is *shibai*. Spectrum needs to create greater access, not less. Mr. Viola closed by stating Hawaiian Telcom is not moving their channels and that Spectrum many not have as many loyal subscribers as it did in the past.

Buck Rogers, producer of Star Track, has been on `Ōlelo for 20 years. Mr. Rogers commented that Hawaii kids are getting into the Los Angeles music scene because of him. Mr. Rogers needs to know where the `Ōlelo channels are located. Mr. Rogers questioned why `Ōlelo channels are being moved when they do not need to be moved. Mr. Rogers added that it took years to build his product and the new `Ōlelo channels are not part of the standard cable package.

Jim Brewer, producer of Full Democracy which has been on `Ōlelo for 25 years, asked DCCA to drive a hard bargain as possible against Spectrum. Mr. Brewer closed by stating that we live in a "corporatetocracy" which doesn't care or share.

Kalani Michelle, `Ōlelo volunteer for over 20 years, commented that `Ōlelo is one of the few places that provides information on their organization and alternative medical treatments. She is trying to save the world and `Ōlelo channels should remain where they are.

Daniel Rufel, North Metro producer and `Ōlelo volunteer, suggested that the CAC members ask more questions and press Spectrum to find out what "clustering" is all about and why local channels are separated from other local news networks and why local news networks are not with the other news channels. Suggests that any offers be obtained in writing.

Patricia Beekman a participant in the Kupuna Films program has gained a lot from 'Ōlelo. People can put films and stories online that you would not hear about without 'Ōlelo. Ms. Beekman wants to keep 'Ōlelo prominent, and the lower the channel number the more exposure it will get. Ms. Beekman commented that moving the 'Ōlelo channels will limit new viewers from discovering 'Ōlelo. Ms. Beekman urges keeping Spectrum's feet to the fire and she also wants 'Ōlelo to have equal time to give

comment as Spectrum's representative. Spectrum should not be given much weight because it did not give the right amount of financial support.

Ed Tsang of the Project Management Institute has used `Ōlelo for public service announcements and now uses `Ōlelo for training videos for project managers. Mr. Tsang went on to explain that the Project Management Institute is a non-professional society that has an integrated focus and does a lot of planning that involves many stakeholders. Mr. Tsang added that they work hard on their programs and would like them to be seen. Mr. Sang wants to keep his and other producers' shows at Channel 53.

Kaukaohu Wahilani has watched `Ōlelo since his youth. Mr. Wahilani stated that his good friend, Scotty Wong, is a great resource. Mr. Wahilani, his wife, and their middle son volunteer with `Ōlelo. Mr. Wahilani's highlighted Malama Makua Valley as an informative program. Mr. Wahilani questioned Spectrum's profit over people and its plan to make channel changes when the system is not broken. Mr. Wahilani closed by stating that the voice of the people is the voice of God and Spectrum should be a good neighbor.

Carroll Cox commented that `Ōlelo is important to the community and something that cannot be found throughout the nation. `Ōlelo airs the programs that he produces in a professional way. Mr. Cox stated that channel slamming is not appropriate and he cannot believe that someone would introduce such an action.

Kealii Lopez, Director of Government Relations at Alston Hunt Floyd & Ing, (former DCCA Director and past President/CEO of `Ōlelo), thanked Administrator Kim and Director Awakuni Colón for holding the CAC meeting. Ms. Lopez began by stating that she has worn a variety of hats in her career. She commented that Oceanic was a good public partner because its local employees knew they would encounter angry people around town. When corporate headquarters are far away it is easy to make decisions since they don't feel the consequences. Ms. Lopez hopes `Ōlelo archives this CAC meeting and sends a link to Charter's corporate headquarters. Ms. Lopez has trust that DCCA and the CAC will do what can be done. Ms. Lopez asked that Decision & Order No. 153 be looked at regarding the 10% of channel capacity that was previously given to `Ōlelo, which is equivalent to 60 digital channels today. Ms. Lopez wants to go back to the 10% capacity. Ms. Lopez closed by saying that the spirit of *malama* is imperative in all relationships and transactions in Hawaii.

Sabina Kupa mentioned that schools use `Ōlelo as an educational tool. Ms. Kupa commented that schools generally do not allow students to view

channels above 100, because parents believe those channels are movie channels which require extensive administrative procedures in order to use in a curriculum. The movement of the `Ōlelo channels will prevent students from watching `Ōlelo at school because schools do not have the funds to purchase digital boxes.

Patrick Marksbury, Full Sail University graduate, praised `Ōlelo because it provided him with a path to a new career. Mr. Marksbury mentioned that `Ōlelo benefits people with its limited resources. Spectrum needs to understand the gravity of the changes and ramifications.

Ulu Meyerhof learned how to edit from `Ōlelo. Ms. Meyerhof believes that `Ōlelo carries the Hawaiian spirit. Ms. Meyerhof does not want `Ōlelo to be banished to "digital Siberia", and is concerned about the affordability of digital boxes unless it is free and not just for a month. She also expressed concern about the channels being put in 'Ōlelo's place and the taking away of the people's voice.

Jaylee Canoy requested that no changes be made to `Ōlelo access as it isn't in the best interest of her family and community. Students take great pride in the work they create and produce with the help of `Ōlelo. Ms. Canoy's family looks forward to watching her programs, especially her grandparents. Ms. Canoy closed by stating that if channels are changed, she will ask her family to change cable and internet provider.

Shaylee Gomes wants to keep `Ōlelo at its current channels, because it is inconvenient if adjustments are made. `Ōlelo keeps people connected and informed, and it allows *keiki* to produce original content.

Ben Gates, on behalf of Representative Cedric Gates who provided written comment, opposes the move by Charter and through hard work `Ōlelo has successfully branded its channels. The relocation will see `Ōlelo lose viewership and result in unnecessary costs.

Michael Daley asked what DCCA could do to fix the problem. Mr. Daley commented that the change in channels will cripple the government and if DCCA cannot stand up to private corporations it is conspiring with corporations to sabotage the public. Mr. Daley appreciates the First Amendment which includes access to free speech. Government owns the entire domain and the dirt should be treated as a public domain. Mr. Daley asked why does cable get some grace. Mr. Daley commented that people own the ground and the cable lines, and government owns capitalism or some other system. Mr. Daley closed by stating that everyone is struggling for finance due to globalization and cannot afford to

pay bullies. It is important that the public has a voice and corporate media is not interested in covering this issue.

Dr. Leonard Horowitz, has a degree in public health from Harvard University, is a media producer and wants consistent channel numbers based on the language in a 1993 agreement. Dr. Horowitz stated that he does not live in Hawaii, but is working with 'Ōlelo to produce programs on significant issues not available due to special interest and regulatory captures. Dr. Horowitz discussed the issue of social crisis of evil obedience and closed by stating that fake news dominates and the only voice of truth and reason comes from 'Ōlelo. There is a public duty by law to speak up if something is going wrong due to the damage, manipulation, and brainwashing of the mainstream media.

Sherri Kane, an investigative journalist, representing "we the people" opened by stating the FOX censors and `Ōlelo is being censored. Ms. Kane thinks that `Ōlelo is the best because it is free of censorship. Ms. Kane wants another voice for "we the people" that is outside of mainstream media and is appalled that `Ōlelo is moving to "digital Siberia." Ms. Kane mentioned that mainstream media did not attend the CAC meeting.

Oren Tsutsumi commented about the channels of oppression who are only in it for the profit. Mr. Tsutsumi continued by stating that capitalist cable is not offering equal access to lines of communication. Mr. Tsutsumi does not want channels hidden as people's voices will be silenced. Mr. Tsutsumi closed by saying that 'Ōlelo gives equal access, but real agency and does not assume people are stupid, they do not need packaged propaganda. 'Ōlelo allows transformative change.

Andre Wooten, Esq., produces the program Color in the Constitution. Mr. Wooten commented that the U.S. is created in a dichotomy, men are equal, but others are slaves. Mr. Wooten continued by stating that the President slurred an entire continent, however, Mr. Wooten visited Egypt, the Nile, and does shows on real African history. Africa is a historical paradise. Mr. Wooten wants to add up the votes from the testifiers, because we either have a democracy or fascism. Mr. Wooten closed by informing the audience that if anyone would like to file an injunction, they should call Andre Wooten, Esq. at 545-4165. The moving of the channels is wrong.

Jesse Ponce de Leon commented that it is sad that the news media did not cover this issue. Mr. Ponce de Leon congratulated the kids for speaking out. Spectrum broke his internet modem and he switched to Hawaiian Telcom. Mr. Ponce de Leon did a lot of research on Charter back in 2015 and found it to be a bad actor. 'Ōlelo shows new things and for *kupuna* who do not have the internet this is important. Mr. Ponce de Leon closed by stating that it is a shame what has been done to the Hawaiian people. He stated that DCCA told him that Spectrum can do whatever they want. Mr. Ponce de Leon noted there is legislation and things need to happen to support the community which is 'Ōlelo.

Grant Okazaki of the Young Progressives Demanding Action Hawaii ("YPDA"), represents a group that promotes progressive agendas. YPDA gathered 22 State Senator signatures in support of `Ōlelo and defiance of the move to other channels. Mr. Okazaki stated that `Ōlelo set his career path by providing a video class for high schoolers, and that moving the channels will take something precious from the community.

Daniela Minerbi, statement read by Patricia Beekman, states that Spectrum's actions will result in a smaller `Ōlelo, reducing its ability to be the local voice and affect freedom of speech in Hawaii. `Ōlelo is the public voice and the channel move is unnecessary.

Mr. Silva commented that the testifiers presented a good cross-section of the community and that it is unusual that all the testifiers came to the same conclusion, but there needs to be time to deliberate.

Mr. Bryan echoed Mr. Silva's comments and stated that government, the public, and everyone in between has been heard. Mr. Bryan commented that there are no positive aspects to the proposed channel move, and Spectrum should reconsider and at the very least give it more thought and provide answers to the questions that have been asked.

Mr. Wong commented that the public has spoken and it was good to hear from the people. He noted that there should be a review of the comments such as Kealii Lopez's comments. Mr. Wong further stated that there is a need to see what can be done for the benefit of the people. There was no law presented that DCCA can mandate Charter to not move the channels and until then it is a business decision. Further research is needed, but Charter needs to carefully consider what was presented and do what is good for the uniqueness of Hawaii and its culture and people.

Director Awakuni Colón thanked the public for attending and giving comments. Director Awakuni Colón thanked the CAC members for coming on short notice. Director Awakuni Colón thanked Charter for presenting and listening to the public's comments.

V.	Announcements	
	None.	
VI.	Adjournment – The meeting was adjourned at 8:37 p.m.	
		Taken and recorded by:
		Kyle Kagihara
		Date: